

Annex G Level 2 Project Selection and Evaluation Scoring

Selection criteria

The large portfolio of 725 funded projects and the practical limitations imposed by the Evaluation's mandate has meant that only a small proportion of the total projects can be evaluated.

The list of 38 projects with 36 grantees was selected from a list of grant funded projects with limited information relating to grant amount, location, sector and sub-sector and phase using the following process:

- plans to interview in three locations, Tamale in the North Zone, Kumasi for the Central Zone and Accra (and Tema) for the Coastal Zone
- at least one project was sought from each region in Ghana outside of the interview locations
- projects were divided into large, medium and small, based on the grant size of GHS 100,000+; GHS 25,000-100,000; and smaller than GHS 25,000 with projects selected in each subdivision, but with a bias on large projects so that the selection represented a significant grant spend
- a balance was sought between industry, services and agriculture sectors
- at least one project was sought from economic sub-sectors with significant advocacy action, defined as sub-sectors which BUSAC funded 10 or more projects, on the basis that the issues in these sectors were considered important for change
- at least one project dealt primarily with minority or women's issues, although gender issues would be looked at for all projects
- a reasonable balance between phase 1 and phase 2 projects
- a distinction is drawn between largely Accra-based organisations dealing with national issues and more local advocacy initiatives.

A random selection was made in accordance with the process outlined above based first on size, then location, then sector. The resulting selection was scrutinised to determine sub-sectoral balance and minor adjustments were made to the selection to improve the outcome for the other desired criteria. Statistics relating to the selection outcome in relation to the criteria is also provided below.

The selected portfolio has the characteristics shown in Table 1 compared to the overall BUSAC portfolio:

Table 1 - Level 2 Evaluation - project selection characteristics

Location:

Criterion	Selection	Selection portfolio	Total portfolio	%	Review Team Notes
Location – interview centres	Greater Accra	18	185	9.7%	Includes national programmes
	Ashanti (Kumasi)	6	58	10.3%	
	North (Tamale)	7	37	18.9%	
At least one from other regions	Brong Ahafo	1	117	0.9%	
	Central	1	66	1.5%	
	Eastern	1	41	2.4%	
	Western	1	75	1.3%	
	Upper East	1	42	2.4%	
	Upper West	1	35	2.8%	

	Volta	1	68	1.5%	
Total		38	725	5.2%	

Grant size:

Criterion	Grant	Selection portfolio	Total portfolio	%	Notes
Large	>GHS 100,000	16	32	50.0%	Contains many national issue grantees
Medium	GHS 25-100,000	16	471	3.4%	
Small	GHS <25,000	6	222	2.7%	
Total		38	725	5.2%	

Sectors:

Sector	Sub-sector with >9 projects	Selection portfolio	Total portfolio	%	Notes
Agriculture	Processing and marketing	3	36		
	Cereals, nuts	1	50		
	Fresh water fish	1	10		
	Poultry	1	13		
	Sugar orange, fruit	1	17		
	Vegetables	0	26		Potential to explore picking one of this projects at the expense of processing/ marketing
	Other	5	117		Cattle, cocoa, forestry, pigs, poultry
	Total	12	269	4.4%	
Services	Creative arts	4	31		2 tailoring/ dressmaking, 1 comedy and 1 hairdressing
	Labour unions	1	19		
	Media	4	27		Large, national projects
	Professional bodies	0	12		Many professional bodies were selected but categorised under their sub-sector
	Mechanical/ garage	1	21		
	Road	1	47		
	Wholesale/ retail		54		Could pick 1 or 2 at the expense of tailoring/ dressmaking and potentially media.
	Other	5	112		1 BDS, 1 Trade Union, 3 multiple sub-sector
	Total	16	323	4.9%	
Industry	Wood	1	21		
	Mining	2	10		
	Other	7	102		1 Leather, 1 paper, 2 multiple sub-sector, 3

					building/construction (last category is potentially overrepresented)
	Total	10	133	7.5%	Industry is marginally overrepresented
	Grand total	38	725	5.2%	

Minority and women-focused:

Two women- focused projects selected, one of which is handicapped women.

Phase 1 and 2 projects:

Phase	Selection portfolio	Total portfolio	%	Notes
1	16	362	4.4%	
2	22	363	6.0%	Bias because of large projects which are in phase 2
Total	38	725	5.2%	

The selected projects are as shown in Table 2.

Table 2 - Selected projects for review

Name of Association	Title of advocacy action	Grant amount GHS	Sector	Sub-sector	Phase	Region	Status of grant
Ghana Journalists Association	“Using sustainable radio and television platforms to articulate the concerns of business for ...	263,087	Services	Media houses	2	Greater Accra	Completed
Consumer Protection Agency	Advocacy to enact consumer protection law in Ghana by the Consumer Protection Agency	231,672	Services	Multi-purpose	2	Greater Accra	Stakeholder
A Coalition of national PSOS led by the Ghana Bar Association	Review of the NRSC Act to change the commission into an authority	223,545	Services	Road transport	2	Greater Accra	Follow up
Private Enterprise Federation	Streamlining cross-sectoral licensing requirements in Ghana	220,637	Services	Multi-purpose	2	Greater Accra	Sensitization & media activities
Sapphire Ghana Limited	Promoting business advocacy through comedy	146,471	Services	Creative arts	2	Greater Accra	Completed

Name of Association	Title of advocacy action	Grant amount GHS	Sector	Sub-sector	Phase	Region	Status of grant
Ghana National Tailors and Dressmakers Association, Cape Coast	Ensuring fair bidding procedures in the award of school uniform contracts	65,299	Services	Creative arts	2	Central	Dialogue
Progressive Traders Association	Advocacy for provision of market facilities in Tamale Central Market	31,500	Services	Multi-purpose	2	Northern	Follow up
Private Enterprise Foundation	Restructuring support for PEF to become an effective research and advocacy organisation	187,870	Industry	Multi-purpose	2	Greater Accra	Dialogue
Chartered Institute Of Building - Ghana Center	Call for establishment of a Construction Industry Development Authority	152,995	Industry	Building contractors	2	Greater Accra	Research
Ghana Contractors Association Council	Review of the Factory Inspectorate Act	113,022	Industry	Construction	2	Greater Accra	Research
Association of Building and Civil Engineering Contractors of Ghana - National	Advocacy for a regulatory body to regulate the activities of the construction industry	109,231	Industry	Building contractors	2	Greater Accra	Completed
Ghana National Small Scale Miners Association	Advocacy for streamlining the small scale mining sub-sector into national mining policies framework	108,892	Industry	Large and Small Scale Mining	2	Greater Accra	Research
Birim South Carpenters Association	Advocacy to locate industrial village for carpenters at Birim South	62,729	Industry	Wood Processing (Carvers and Carpenters)	2	Eastern	Completed
Peasant Farmers Association of Ghana	Promulgation of a cattle ranching legislation to regulate the activities of Fulani herdsmen in Ghana	152,513	Agriculture	Multi-purpose	2	Northern	Research

Name of Association	Title of advocacy action	Grant amount GHS	Sector	Sub-sector	Phase	Region	Status of grant
Ghana National Association of Poultry Farmers	Ensuring enactment of Ecowas common external tariff on poultry imports as stated in 2011 budget	127,842	Agriculture	Poultry	2	Greater Accra	Completed
Ghana Cocoa Coffee & Shea Nut Farmers Association	Advocacy for the re-introduction of the Akuafu cheque payment system	118,629	Agriculture	Cocoa Production and Marketing	2	Greater Accra	Completed
Private Afforestation Developers Organisation	Full implementation of Forest Development Plantation Fund Act 2000, Act 583	99,366	Agriculture	Forestry and Logging	2	Ashanti	Dialogue
Somirinan Young Farmers League Co-Operative Society Limited	Increasing access to veterinary service.	59,600	Agriculture	Piggery	2	Northern	Dialogue
Shea Nut Farmers Processors and Buyers Association of Ghana	Towards halting the arbitrary felling of the shea tree.	50,425	Agriculture	Cereals, Pulses and Nuts Production	2	Northern	Complete
Organic Mango Outgrowers Association	The enactment of a bye law against causing bush fires to farms and its enforcement.	42,285	Agriculture	Agri-Processing and Marketing	2	Northern	Completed
Afigya Sekyere District Citrus Farmers Association	Commercial farming sustainability	30,126	Agriculture	Sugar, Oranges, Pineapple and Banana	2	Ashanti	Completed
Denugu Noor-Yeni Soap Makers	Access to agro-processing facilities for enhanced production	27,000	Agriculture	Agric Processing and Marketing	2	Upper East	Completed
Ghana Journalists Association	Using the media to promote small scale business concerns	945,026	Services	Media houses	1	Greater Accra	Completed
Network Broadcasting Company Ltd	Advocacy for anti-corruption reforms	134,262	Services	Media houses	1	Greater Accra	Completed
Dynamic Spare Parts Dealers Association/ Suame Magazine	Promoting technological best practices at Suame Magazine for investment	80,657	Services	Mechanics and Garages	1	Ashanti	Completed

Name of Association	Title of advocacy action	Grant amount GHS	Sector	Sub-sector	Phase	Region	Status of grant
Ampem Darko Radio Station	Action for tourism sector development in Kintampo	33,986	Services	Media houses	1	Brong Ahafo	Completed
Union of Private Security Employees of Ghana	Economic empowerment of private security labour	33,342	Services	Labour unions	1	Greater Accra	Completed
Ghana Progressive Hairdressers Association	In-flood of fake imported hair products killing GPHDA's business	11,427	Services	Creative arts	1	Ashanti	Completed
Ghana Electronic Serving Technicians-Aflao	Advocacy for removal of "Double" TV license fee	10,962	Services	Multi-purpose	1	Volta	Abandoned mid-way
Ghana Nat. Tailors & Dressmakers Asso.-Saboba	Advocacy to regularise tax reviews and payment procedures	3,725	Services	Creative arts	1	Northern	Completed
Women and Enterprise Network	Publication of a newsletter to advocate for safe working conditions for women in the informal sector	2,502	Services	Business development services	1	Greater Accra	Completed
Association of Ghana Industries, Ghana National Ch.	Advocacy for effective implementation of private sector development policies and capacity building	140,499	Industry	Multi-purpose	1	Greater Accra	Completed
Media and Printing Industry Workers Union of Ghana Federation Of Labour	Advocacy for sound industrial relations practice in Ghana	66,879	Industry	Paper products and Printing	1	Greater Accra	Completed
Prestea Mining Group	Advocacy for information and data on geological-viable land for artisanal mining	33,876	Industry	Large and Small Scale Mining	1	Western	Completed
Mwinikuubu Disabled Women Association	Inclusion of disabled women into NBSSI'S business support services	8,910	Industry	Leather products	1	Upper West	Completed

Name of Association	Title of advocacy action	Grant amount GHS	Sector	Sub-sector	Phase	Region	Status of grant
Adwene Sellers Association	Advocacy for the provision of security on the Kumasi-Yeji Highway.	26,399	Agriculture	Fish Processing and Marketing	1	Ashanti	Completed
Northern Livestock Farmers Association -	Advocacy for regulatory policy to check Fulani herdsmen in the north	25,218	Agriculture	Cattle rearing	1	Northern	Completed
Ghana Agricultural Input Dealers Association	Advocacy to reduce faking and adulteration of pesticides in Ghana	21,415	Agriculture	Agric inputs marketing	1	Ashanti	Completed

Evaluation Markings

Table 3 - Level 2 selected Projects - Evaluation markings

Name of Association	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Results	Org. Sustain-Ability*	Fin. Sustain-Ability**	Comments
Ghana Journalists Association	1	2	2	2	2	2	GJA has received 2 related grants
Consumer Protection Agency	3	2	2	N/A	2	2	Ongoing
Ghana Bar Association	1	2	2	N/A	2	2	Ongoing Based on telephone interview
Private Enterprise Foundation	1	2	2	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ongoing
Sapphire Ghana Limited	1	2	1	N/A	N/A	N/A	Based on review of file Grants almost doubled during the course of implementation
Ghana National Tailors and Dressmakers Association, Cape Coast	2	3	3	4	3	4	Based on review of file
Progressive Traders Association	1	2	2	2	2	3	Ongoing
Private Enterprise Foundation	1	1	2	3	2	3	Ongoing
Chartered Institute Of Building - Ghana	2	2	2	N/A	2	3	Ongoing
Ghana Contractors Association Council	2	2	2	N/A	2	3	Ongoing Based on review of file
Association of Building and Civil Engineering Contractors of Ghana	1	2	3	3	2	3	
Ghana National Small Scale Miners Association	1	2	3	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ongoing
Birim South Carpenters Association	3	2	2	3	2	4	Based on telephone interview
Peasant Farmers Association of Ghana	1	2	2	N/A	2	2	Ongoing Unlikely to achieve the intended result due to the issue's sensitivity
Ghana National Association of Poultry Farmers	3	2	3	4	2	3	
Ghana Cocoa Coffee & Shea Nut Farmers Association	3	2	2	2	2	3	

Name of Association	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Results	Org. Sustain-Ability*	Fin. Sustain-Ability**	Comments
Private Afforestation Developers Organisation	1	2	2	N/A	N/A	N/A	Ongoing
Somirinan Young Farmers League Co-Operative Society Limited	3	2	3	2	2	4	
Shea Nut Farmers Processors and Buyers Association of Ghana	1	2	2	3	2	3	
Organic Mango Outgrowers Association	1	2	2	2	3	4	
Afigya Sekyere District Citrus Farmers Association	1	2	2	2	3	4	
Denugu Noor-Yeni Soap Makers	3	2	3	2	4	4	
Ghana Journalists Association	1	2	2	2	2	3	
Network Broadcasting Company Ltd	1	2	2	2	3	3	
Dynamic Spare Parts Dealers Association/Suame Magasine	1	2	2	3	2	2	
Ampem Darko Radio Station	2	2	2	3	3	4	
Union of Private Security Employees of Ghana	1	1	2	2	2	3	
Ghana Progressive Hairdressers Association	2	2	3	3	3	4	
Ghana Electronic Serving Technicians-Aflao	2	1	1	N/A	N/A	N/A	Abandoned mid-way due to death of chairman
Ghana Nat. Tailors & Dressmakers Association - Saboba	1	2	3	3	3	4	Based on review of file
Women and Enterprise Network	1	1	1	1	2	2	
Association of Ghana Industries	1	1	2	2	2	3	
Media and Printing Industry Workers Union of Ghana Federation of Labour	1	1	2	3	1	2	
Prestea Mining Group	1	1	3	3	2	3	Based on review of file
Mwinikuubu Disabled Women Association	2	1	1	2	3	4	Based on review of file
Adwene Sellers Association	2	1	2	3	2	3	
Northern Livestock	1	1	2	4	3	4	

Name of Association	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Results	Org. Sustain-Ability*	Fin. Sustain-Ability**	Comments
Farmers Association -							
Ghana Agricultural Input Dealers Association	1	1	2	3	3	3	Based on review of file
Traditional Caterers Association-Tuuri Ni Lebi Tia	1	2	2	3	2	3	

*Organisational sustainability refers to the PSO's capacity to undertake structured advocacy actions in the future

**Financial sustainability refers to the extent to which the PSO is dependent on external financial support for future structured advocacy actions

The results grouped in accordance with the marking grid are shown in Table 4 .

Table 4 - Assessment of reviewed projects:

	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Results	Org Sustainability	Financial sustainability
1= total	25	11	4	1	1	0
2 = largely	8	27	26	12	22	7
3 = neutral	6	1	9	13	10	16
4= largely not	0	0	0	3	1	11
5= not	0	0	0	0	0	0
N/A – not yet achieved, not measurable, not applicable	0	0	0	10	5	5
Total	39	39	39	39	39	
Average	1.51	1.74	2.13	2.62	2.32	3.12

- Projects are largely relevant to BUSAC and Ghana private sector development agendas. A number of projects appear to have little economic additionality however.
- Projects have invariably been run efficiently, and in line with the BUSAC advocacy capacity building model.
- Projects have been largely effective in providing access to duty bearers and increasing capacity of organisations to advocate in accordance with the BUSAC advocacy model.
- Results have been mixed, for a variety of reasons, but almost half of projects reviewed are yet to achieve results, representing a mixture of lack of funding to implement agreements and the long period required to achieve objectives.
- The sustainability marks for this portfolio is higher than it would have been for a non-weighted portfolio. The weighting favoured national level projects and advocates.