

Final Thematic Paper
on
Capacity Development
(Thematic Paper no. 7)

for the

Joint Evaluation of the Ghana – Denmark Development Co-operation from 1990 to 2006

File: 104.A.1.e.65, contract no. PK 1670

Submitted by

Particip GmbH
Your Partner in Change
Merzhauser Straße 183
D - 79100 Freiburg
Germany
Tel.: +49 (0)761 790 740
Fax: +49 (0)761 790 7940
<http://www.particip.de>



19 March 2008

Table of contents

Table of Contents	i
List of tables.....	ii
List of boxes.....	ii
List of acronyms.....	ii
SUMMARY	V
1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
2 POLICY FRAMEWORK FOR CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT IN GHANA.....	2
2.1 Key points in State capacity development in Ghana	2
2.2 Critical drivers of capacity development.....	3
2.3 Government’s policies related to capacity development	3
3 TRENDS IN CAPACITY OF PUBLIC SECTOR, CIVIL SOCIETY AND INDEPENDENT GOVERNANCE INSTITUTIONS AND PRIVATE SECTOR	4
3.1 Public sector.....	4
3.1.1 Public Sector Reform	4
3.1.2 Decentralisation	6
3.2 Civil society and independent governance institutions	6
3.3 Private sector	7
3.4 Sector-specific capacity development initiatives	9
3.5 Conclusion: How has capacity of organisations and authorities to deliver appropriate services evolved in Ghana?.....	11
4 DANIDA’S POLICIES RELATED TO CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT: AN INNOVATIVE DONOR AT THE FOREFRONT OF POLICY GUIDANCE FOR CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT	14
5 CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT IN DANIDA SUPPORT TO GHANA.....	17
5.1 Capacity development in the Country Programmes.....	17
5.2 How has capacity development been addressed by Danida in Ghana?	18
5.3 How relevant were Danida’s capacity development measures to in- country needs?.....	19
5.4 How did Danida consider capacity development issues in policy dialogue?.....	21
5.5 How satisfied were trainees of all kinds with the Danida’s capacity development measures?	23
5.6 Impacts and sustainability	24
5.6.1 Administrative and institutional reforms and improved service delivery	24
5.6.2 Staff retention, sustainability and brain drain	30

5.7	Special cases of Danish support	32
5.7.1	Academic qualification upgrading – Denmark’s support to higher education	32
5.7.2	MDBS and capacity development to implement the GPRS	33
5.8	The role of technical assistance	36
6	SUMMARY ASSESSMENT, RELATED TO DAC CRITERIA	38
7	OVERALL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	40
8	ANNEXES	43
8.1	Interview guidelines.....	43
8.1.1	Evaluation question on capacity development, level 1	43
8.1.2	Interview questions for capacity development, level 1	47
8.1.3	Evaluation question on capacity development, level 3.....	48
8.2	Focus group discussion with representatives of Danish support to the University of Ghana.....	50
8.2.1	Target group	50
8.2.2	Main research question.....	51
8.2.3	Major questions.....	51
8.3	Persons met.....	52
8.4	Bibliography (major documents).....	53
8.5	Higher Education projects under ENRECA	55

List of tables

Table 1:	Summary of DAC-criteria assessment regarding capacity development across sectors	38
Table 2:	Summary of overall conclusions and recommendations	40

List of boxes

Box 1:	Milestones in capacity development in Ghana since independence	2
Box 2:	Key GoG public sector reform initiatives	5
Box 3:	Denmark’s incremental approach to analysing capacity development	14
Box 4:	A methodology to support capacity development.....	15
Box 5:	Four options for organisational change.....	16
Box 6:	Successes of capacity development in the water and sanitation sector	27

List of acronyms

ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
AWLA	Association of Women Lawyers
B2B	Business to Business Programme (present name)
BLD	Business Law Division

BLR	Business Law Reform
BSPS	Business Sector Programme Support
BUSAC	Business Sector Advocacy Challenge Fund
CC	Commercial Court
CDD	Center for Democratic Development
CERSGIS	Centre for Remote Sensing Unit, ULG
CG	Consultative Group
CHAG	Christian Health Association of Ghana
CHRAJ	Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
CWSA	Community Water and Sanitation Agency
DA	District administration
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
Danida	Danish International Development Assistance
DFID	Department for International Development Co-operation
DFR	Department of Feeder Roads
DKK	Danish Kroner
DP	Development Partners
DSDA	Danida Support to District Assemblies
DUR	Department of Urban Roads
DWD	District Works Department
DWST	District Water and Sanitation Team
EC	Electoral Commission
EQ	Evaluation Question
ERP	Economic Recovery Programme
EU	European Union
E-W	East – West
FoE	Friends of the Earth
FTA	Foreign Technical Assistance
GAD	Gender And Development
GDI	Gender Development Institute
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GEST	Gender Theme Support Group
GG	Good Governance
GGHR	Good Governance and Human Rights
GHA	Ghana Highway Authority
GHS	Ghana Health Service
GoG	Government of Ghana
GPRS	Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy
GPRS 1	Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy 1
GPRS 2	Growth & Poverty Reduction Strategy 2
G-RAP	Ghana's Research and Advocacy Programme
GRSP	Global Road Safety Partnership
HIPC	Heavily Indebted Poor Countries
HIV/AIDS	Human immunodeficiency virus/Acquired immune deficiency syndrome
HR	Human Rights
HRD	Human Resources Development
IDEG	Institute of Democratic Governance
IEA	Institute of Economic Affairs
IGI	Independent Governance Institution
IMF	International Monetary Fund

ING	International Needs Ghana
Km	Kilometre
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MAID	Management AID
MDA	Ministries, Departments and Agencies
MDBS	Multi Donor Budget Support
MFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MoFEP	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MoH	Ministry of Health
MOH	Ministry of Housing
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoPSR	Ministry of Public Sector Reform
MoT	Ministry of Transport
MoWAC	Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs
MTEF	Medium-Term Expenditure Framework
MWRWH	Ministry of Water Resources Works and Housing
NDAP	National Decentralisation Action Plan
NDPC	National Development Planning Commission
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
NMT	Non-motorised transport
NRSC	National Road Safety Commission
OECD/DAC	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development/ Development Assistance Committee
PAF	Performance Assessment Framework (for MDBS)
PFM	Public Financial Management
PHC	Primary Health Care
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
PRGF	Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility
PSDP	Private Sector Development Programme (also termed 'PS-programme')
PSDS	Private Sector Development Strategy
PUFMARP	Public Financial Management Reform Program
RAO	Research and Advocacy Organisation
RDE	Royal Danish Embassy
SI	Spot improvement
SPEED	Support Programme for Enterprise Empowerment and Development
SPS	Sector Programme Support
SSA	Sub-Sahara Africa
SWAp	Sector Wide Approach
TA	Technical Assistance
ToR	Terms of Reference
TP	Thematic Paper
TSPS	Transport Sector Programme Support
UGBS	Centre for International Business at the Business School
US\$	United States Dollar
USD	US \$
VAT	Value Added Tax
WB	World Bank
WID	Women in development
WRC	Water Resources Commission
WRIS	Water Resources Information System

Summary

Ghana benefits from a very high level of external donor involvement and is highly aid dependent¹. The (cross-cutting) field of capacity development is no exception, but rather a case in point. Although sometimes carried out on intermittent and unstructured basis, donor involvement is a crucial element of capacity development. One of the major challenges is achieving a sound balance between capacity development efforts oriented towards the public sector, civil society or the private sector and, beyond that, the different/dual dimensions/aspects of each sector (e.g. policy dialogue versus service delivery).

In particular, there is rather an asymmetry in the donors' capacity development activities in terms of public sphere and the sphere of civil society, with an emphasis on the former (capacity development in the private sector seems to often be focused – with reason – on creating an enabling business environment). The appropriateness of this approach can be questioned as – despite the efforts – the (recent) results in state transformation are disappointing². One of the reasons certainly contributing to this outcome is the absence of broad based and enduring social and political support enabling such a transformation³. Based on experience from other countries, it is reasonable to believe that it is exactly a strong civil society that could significantly add to the generation of such transformation-enthusiastic social and political support. However, the limited resource base of Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) restricts their ability to build their own organisational and institutional capacity. Partly as a consequence of such a situation, CSOs and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) have rather limited influence on Ghanaian society.

Nevertheless, there is reason to believe that on the whole, donor support for capacity development, encompassing support to changes in overall policies and the related institutional frameworks, has been helpful in at least a good number of cases, and has contributed to improving framework conditions for more effective aid (and public service) delivery. Assessing the issue from this perspective, one may say that capacity development efforts are at least partly bearing fruit (depending on the sector), and that therefore the need for external technical assistance has decreased, although it is still required and present in a number of areas.

Concretely, there exist positive developments in terms of strengthening (predominantly) Government of Ghana's (GoG) capacity. Progress is evident in the domain of Public Financial Management (PFM), as, for instance, reported in the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC-AAP) exercise (2004), which indicated improvements in the quality of budget preparation, financial commitment and expenditure control, and reporting and auditing.

Effectiveness of the various policy frameworks' implementation is, however, still lacking, owing not least to problems of staff attraction and retention in the respective government services. There is a shortage of expertise in critical areas of public administration such as (i) policy analysis, (ii) strategic planning and (iii) financial management. In a way, this has become an endemic problem of the public sector. Service has, in consequence, weakened, with characteristically low morale.

Additionally, the fact that decentralisation efforts are far behind schedule considerably hampers development (and reduces the potential impact of aid). Without the political will to implement the required decentralisation effectively (including more sophisticated civil soci-

¹ See also Thematic Paper 1.

² WB (2005)

³ Freeman (2005)

ety involvement) and to put in place the required resources and organisational structures, the impact of combined donor efforts will remain limited.

In the above context, Danish support to capacity development has also been described as focusing mainly on building government capacity rather than on strengthening civil society (Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development / Development Assistance Committee (OECD/DAC) 2007). However, the evaluators do not fully subscribe to this finding, as considerable Danida support has indeed gone into strengthening civil society, not necessarily always directly to grassroots organisations but to intermediaries that advocate for civil society rights, transparency, accountability, and so on. Nevertheless, the evaluation agrees with the OECD/DAC (2007) observation that “there is a need to ensure an appropriate balance between these two levels of support in each context, based on an analysis of specific situations.” In the case of the private sector, Danida not only focused on support via the Private Sector Development Programme (also termed ‘PS-programme’) (PSDP) and the Business Sector Programme Support (BSPS), but also played an important role in the framework of support to the other sectors enhancing private sector capacity.

In general, relevance of Danida capacity development support has ranged between relevant to highly relevant, with some difference between the sectors. A general lack of both broad capacity development concepts for the supported sectors and usually missing training needs assessments are likely to have reduced possible higher scores for relevance.

Results of Danida support to capacity development in terms of effectiveness are rather mixed. While there are excellent examples of how capacity development can be effective (e.g. water and sanitation sector or also in relation to the issue of gender and gender mainstreaming), examples of rather disappointing results are more frequent. This is mainly due to the fact that, while Danida support can help address urgent needs regarding policy, organisational and institutional changes in the sectors (as it did in most cases), progress will necessarily remain stalled if GoG does not progress, or only progresses slowly, with the required and announced policies and changes in institutional frameworks. This is especially the case for the transport sector.

It should be noted that, in many cases, capacity development issues were present in the policy dialogue. It is unclear, however, to which extent they were always considered by Danida. There are examples where the presence of capacity development topics seems to be rather a “by-product” of a broader dialogue.

Sustainability of capacity development is a perennial issue in Danida support. It is directly related to the level of resources made available and to the institutional framework within which a function is carried out, but also to the political will. Policies, strategies, appropriate institutional frameworks and resources must all be available to permit adequate functionality. Genuine commitment must be identified and consolidated. Looking at capacity development in terms of institutional or organisational development, the most striking examples can be found in the water and sanitation and health sector, and also at the level of Danida support to gender projects. Danida capacity development measures have taken numerous forms – training, short and long courses, Technical Assistance (TA), etc. The water and sanitation and health sectors are those that show the most systematic incorporation of capacity development into all components of their different programmes. It is positive that, despite the lack of clear policy frameworks regarding capacity development across basically all sectors, Danida’s efforts had considerable, although varying, impact. However, the sustainability of these impacts is in doubt. Danida support has helped build sectoral capacities, but could, understandably, not fully overcome unfavourable framework conditions, although its support has certainly helped address such issues in numerous cases. Across the sectors supported, however, there continue to be serious deficiencies in some or all of

these pre-requisites such that whatever modality of capacity development is attempted, results must necessarily remain limited, vulnerable and possibly transient.

Nevertheless, service delivery overall seems to have improved in the Danida supported sectors, especially in the water and sanitation sector, and in the health sector, where it has impacted positively on the sector's capacity, thereby enhancing its performance. This is reflected in an increased utilisation of health services and improvements in some key health outcomes. On the other hand, impact regarding service delivery seems to be lower in the transport sector. However, overall, Danida support contributed to improved levels of administrative and financial management among the supported organisations. This must be seen in conjunction with considerable efforts usually allocated to instigate or support organisational changes in the supported institutions.

Danida support to civil society, Independent Governance Institutions (IGI) and the private sector has helped improve their levels of service delivery, respectively, for IGIs, their capacity to influence policy changes and empower civil society, e.g. regarding gender, where Danida support was very prominent in improving government performance (Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs (MOWAC)).

Sustaining the gains from capacity enhancement was and remains a problem. The issue also relates to the high staff turnover of the various organisations as well as to transfers and changes in organisational structure. Attrition rates are usually considerable, especially in the health sector, but also among organisations dealing with Good Governance and Human Rights (GGHR) or gender. Overall, numerous staff trained were later moved to other units in the organisation or to other districts in the same or other regions, involving schedule changes which often did not necessarily require the application of the knowledge and skills received. Nevertheless, at national level, gained expertise is not necessarily lost (except in the health and, partly, also in the transport sector, with examples of nurses, doctors and engineers working abroad), as it is being channelled into other programmes, regions, or districts.

Generally, donor co-ordination regarding capacity development measures at individual level seems to be at its embryonic state. There is room for improvement, but this will also require a stronger GoG vision to clearly guide capacity development in the sectors.

A number of conclusions and recommendations emerge from the analysis:

1. There is, therefore, a need to constantly tackle and possibly prioritise progress or reform in the **institutional frameworks** in which capacity development should be embedded, i.e. supporting the setting of framework conditions for capacity development within institutions. There is also a need to think in longer time horizons when tackling capacity development in each sector, especially in the field of GGHR. *(i) GoG is required to address capacity development more comprehensively in its sector policies, in the institutional framework it sets for the sectors and in the conditions of service for public servants. (ii) Danida should undertake further efforts to bring and/or keep capacity development on the agenda of donor groups and in dialogue with the government. It might try marketing its capacity development approach to the donor community and to GoG. Danida should further apply its capacity development methodology in support of the ongoing preparatory exercises for the next Country Programme.*
2. "The critical problem is the 'system' that causes talented people to leave the country or perform below their capability" (WB 2005) or they are shifted around in the country. All this contributes to reducing development impacts at the local levels. *(i) GoG should rethink its **staffing policies and rotational systems**, while at the same time devising incentives for performance. Danida might support government in this re-*

- gard. (ii) GoG (with donor support) needs to be more insistent that the resources and benefits of capacity development programmes are fielded and experienced outside the capital region. This should include directing resources to service delivery sites in areas of high poverty.*
3. TA should remain an essential element in Danida support to capacity development. The more Danida support moves away from project-based support with permanent TA, small-scale and co-ordinated **TA** should become the preferred option, thus replying to OECD/DAC 2007, who states that “co-ordination with other donors on TA has increased, but there is still room for improvement”. *In a context where aid increasingly moves away from project-based approaches, Danida should further move towards joint interventions involving joint TA arrangements, wherever possible. This would also help broadening the TA resource base available, especially as increasingly specialised advice will be required.*
 4. As for Danida’s envisaged support to the District Works Department (**DWD**), merging support to transport and water and sanitation, there is evidence that this will require considerable capacity development efforts, both at the district levels and at the central level, e.g. at the MoLGRDE and at LGSS. *(i) GoG with support from DPs should move quickly to implement the NDAP. This can be achieved by engaging civil society organisations extensively in implementing programmes at the district level in order to promote effective decentralisation. (ii) GoG needs to clearly define its requirements in terms of support to operationalising decentralisation, especially in the context of DWD and LGSS. (iii) Danida should co-ordinate its approach and support closely with both GoG and other donors, as, after years of testing and different ways of doing things, there is a need to move much faster along the path to more decentralisation.*
 5. Danida support to capacity development of **civil society and IGIs** requires sustaining over a rather long time span, thus developing a critical mass to better challenge accountability and transparency at all levels, and to participate in policy decision making. Without adequate organisational and institutional capacity in good governance and human rights, implementing institutions will not be able to achieve the intended objectives. *(i) Danida should aim at further strengthening the co-ordination of efforts among donors supporting IGIs and thus also of capacity development efforts between IGIs. This could for instance be done through the G-RAP mechanism and Ibis since these are already established modes of working with CSOs. (ii) Support to civil society, must be continued over a longer time period of about 5 – 10 years in order to lay some solid foundation. Danida must ensure that all project documents include strategies for civil society capacity development which must be linked to key project activities such as support to decentralisation and the IGIs. (iii) Danida should in the private sector aim at strengthening membership based organisations, being sustainable through their commercially viable services offered to members.*
 6. Capacity development regarding **gender and gender mainstreaming** needs further efforts in order for mechanisms to be internalised. *(i) Danida should support capacity enhancement in gender mainstreaming in this regard, ensuring that skills in gender analysis and gender mainstreaming are consistently pursued. (ii) GoG should demonstrate commitment to gender equity by providing the required financial and human resources for national gender policies, strategies and action plans to be implemented. Draft gender sector-specific policies and strategies should also be finalized and implemented. (iii) GoG should support all efforts at building the capacity of decentralised structures through the local government service to promote gender equality.*

1 Introduction

The main purpose of this Joint Evaluation of the Ghana – Denmark Development Cooperation during the period 1998 to 2006 is to evaluate its achievements against its overall development objectives as formulated in development strategies, including the development strategy presented by Ghana in Paris in June 1993; the Ghana Vision 2020; the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy from 2002; the Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy (2000-2002); the Ghana Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy (September 2005); the Danish Strategy ‘Partnership 2000’ and the country strategies for collaboration between Ghana and Denmark published in 1993, 1998 and 2004. Efforts and achievements will be assessed against the contemporary context and standards prevailing at the time when decisions were made.

While the evaluation covers the whole period from 1990 to 2006, its main emphasis is on lessons learned from 1998 (second country strategy for collaboration between Ghana and Denmark) to the present day. Particular attention is paid to lessons learned from implementing the most recent country strategy (2004-2008). While the evaluation period ends at the end of 2006, where possible, the evaluation seeks to reflect developments and changes that have occurred afterwards and are considered relevant to demonstrate progress or balance judgements.

Based on the Terms of Reference (TOR), the tender submitted by Particip and the resulting contract suggested a number of Thematic Papers (TPs) to be prepared as building blocks for the synthesis report. These papers have been circulated and discussed with relevant stakeholders. They are annexed to the synthesis report. However, these papers should not be considered merely or primarily background papers, but essential pillars of the overall evaluation, focusing on specific issues that arose from first discussions and document analysis.

This thematic paper discusses Danish International Development Assistance (Danida) support for capacity development. Such support is generally an essential part of all Danish assistance, and one of the key elements of sustainable development. The question of how far Danish assistance was able to address the issue of capacity development within its different country programme and within the period constitutes the core of this report.

Capacity development is an issue that cuts across all sectors that Danida has supported over the years. This is also true for support under ENRECA which does not form part of the individual country programmes.

OECD/DAC (2006)⁴ has defined capacity and capacity development as follows:

- Capacity is the ability of people, organisations and society as a whole to manage their affairs successfully.
- Capacity development is the process whereby people, organisations and society as a whole unleash, strengthen, create, adapt and maintain capacity over time.

For the purpose of this thematic paper, capacity development is further specified as the development of capacities of:

- the **public sector** to fulfil its mandate and role (e.g., through policy setting, legal and institutional frameworks for development, resource allocation at the appropriate levels, generation of required human resources, and ownership of policies and processes);

⁴ OECD/DAC (2006): The challenge to capacity development: Working towards good practice. Paris: OECD.

- **civil society and independent governance institutions** (e.g., parliament, court of auditors, human rights organisations, political parties, media, CSOs, trade unions, NGOs, faith-based organisations, etc.) to give developmental impetus and play a watchdog role if required;
- the **private sector** to generate a solid basis for economic and social development.

2 Policy framework for capacity development in Ghana

2.1 Key points in State capacity development in Ghana

According to Freeman (2005), the following key dates are milestones in capacity development in Ghana since independence:

Box 1: Milestones in capacity development in Ghana since independence

1957-1983	Extreme political instability, four coups and four military governments (nine regimes/governments in all) in 26 years, extensive problems with corruption.	
1982	Rawlings government began ten years of military rule.	
1983	Announcement by the Government of Ghana (GoG) of the Economic Recovery Program (ERP) and entry by Ghana into Africa's longest standing programme of structural economic adjustment.	
1983-1992	Implementation of the ERP with measures to establish macroeconomic stability, increase revenue generation, reduce public sector spending, improve exchange rate management and liberalize trade.	
1992	New national Constitution and multi-party elections. Under the new constitution, Parliament was given more powers to veto policy proposals which had previously been largely driven by technocrats who enjoyed the support of the military.	
1990-94	Worsening macro-economic situation and suspension of financial support on several occasions by the Bretton Woods institutions. For example, an 80% pay-hike for civil servants raised the wage bill to 8% of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and control of recruitment collapsed and by the mid 1990s central government employment was back at 330,000.	
1994	Creation of the National Institutional Reform Program (NIRP) to encompass and give direction to reform projects and programmes already under way.	
1997	Public Sector Re-Invention and Modernization Strategy for Ghana (PUSERMOS). The strategy focused on five service environments and five areas of transformation:	
	Service Environments <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Central Management Agencies; • The Civil Service; • Sub-vented Agencies; • Local Government; and, • State owned enterprises 	Transformation Areas <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Institutional structures; • Human Resources; • Processes and systems; • Accountability and Performance; and, • Public/Private partnership relationships

The above mentioned PUSERMOS represented a culmination of efforts to reform and modernize the public service in Ghana in the late 1990s and early 2000s. It had the following components:

- The Public Sector Management Reform Program (PSMRP), launched in 1999;
- The Civil Service Performance Improvement Program, launched in 1996;
- The Public Financial Management Program (PUFMARP), launched in 1997;
- The National Governance Program (NGP); and
- Decentralisation.

The results of these efforts at reform have been, at best, mixed. According to Freeman (2003), a GoG report on Strategies for Public Sector Reform in 2003 concluded that the government had lost direction or lacked the required commitment, and that the planned reforms had failed to meet their desired objectives. Furthermore, the World Bank (2005) notes, that “in part because of its consultant- and donor-driven nature, the public sector reform effort, including the Department for International Development Co-operation (DFID)-funded civil service reform program, failed ultimately to deliver a revised pay and rewards system or a career development system, with significant consequences for the development effort as a whole. And the PUFMARP program ... failed to implement the reform agenda in part because it could not overcome resistance from agencies that needed to be committed to the reform agenda but were not.”

In addition, Stevens and Teggemann (2004) note that reforms in Ghana did not lead to meaningful reductions in the civil service because of transfers to subvented Agencies (SA). They estimate the total size of the public sector at about 600,000 personnel and 300 SAs.

2.2 Critical drivers of capacity development

According to Freeman (2005), Ghana possesses “a relatively strong and independent parliament (although one in which MPs were low paid and under-resourced). It also had relatively strong trade unions, civil society organisation, and political opposition parties, and a relatively open government. This raises the question as to why virtually all assessments of Ghana’s efforts to reform the civil service and improve state effectiveness report mainly negative results.” A partial answer can be provided by external evaluations and assessments of Ghana’s progress in developing state capacity. These studies have often cited the following key drivers of the country’s reported relatively poor performance:

- lack of political commitment among parliamentarians (some in fact see the re-establishment of parliamentary democracy itself as the beginning of a process undermining state reform);
- influence of interest groups protecting their wages and positions;
- absence of managerial support at the highest levels in the public service;
- design of programmes with technical management units external to the responsible Ministries, Departments and Agencies;
- unfavourable timing of reforms so that they encounter economic crises and unpredictable flows of resources;
- over-reliance on external, donor-funded consultants to develop strategies, programmes and projects;
- poor and inadequate sequencing of reforms so that too much is tackled too soon, without the possibility of “quick wins” and overwhelming the capacity which already exists.

2.3 Government’s policies related to capacity development

The shortcomings mentioned in the section above are only outcomes of a broader problem characterised by the fact that GoG did not design a comprehensive capacity development strategy. Capacity development issues are addressed in an unstructured and indirect way - very often within the framework of other policies. One example is provided by GoG’s economic priorities throughout the period. While focusing on four basic areas –

- macroeconomic stability,

- growth and employment,
- poverty alleviation, and
- human resource development –

the strategies for realizing these goals involve capacity development issues, in particular:

1. reform of the public sector (especially better revenue generation and expenditure management, as well as divestiture),
2. accelerated private sector development,
3. improved access to basic education and health services,
4. decentralisation in the delivery of essential services, and
5. targeted poverty alleviation and social welfare programmes.

The clear need for consolidation of these goals has been addressed in 2002 in the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS). However, a more concrete definition of GoG's capacity development strategy has not been provided. The overarching goal of the GPRS is to "achieve sustainable, equitable growth, accelerated poverty reduction, and the protection of the vulnerable and excluded within a decentralized democratic environment." The five pillars of the GPRS are:

1. macroeconomic stability,
2. increasing production and employment,
3. promoting human resource development,
4. implementing special programmes for the vulnerable, and
5. ensuring good governance through accountability and transparency.

Although the good governance pillar recognises capacity development needs – e.g., the need to urgently increase the capacity of an appropriately sized public service with radically improved conditions of service⁵ - most of the objectives are rather declaratory and in-depth strategy is missing.

3 Trends in capacity of public sector, civil society and independent governance institutions and private sector

3.1 Public sector

3.1.1 Public Sector Reform

Since the advent of NIRP in 1994, Ghana has launched a series of wide-ranging public sector reform programmes aimed at:

- improving national planning and budgeting;
- reforming public sector pay and linking it to labour market norms in an effort to combat corruption;
- reducing the overall size of the public service,
- nurturing public-private cooperation;

⁵ Ghana GPRS 2003 , p. 4

- reforming subvented agencies and bringing them under budgetary control;
- developing personnel sanction- and reward systems and linking them to performance and management;
- linking budgets and the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) to Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDA) performance; and
- including stakeholders and beneficiaries in a process of consultation for monitoring social impact and service delivery.

According to Freeman (2005), this was “an ever-expanding and broad based effort to transform the public service at central, regional and local levels without first establishing the broad based and enduring social and political support necessary. The absence of this support has provided a basis for effective resistance to change on the part of interest groups. The emerging nature of parliamentary democracy in Ghana is itself cited in reports as a factor in promoting competition for resources and making it difficult to establish a consensus for change.”

It is, therefore, not surprising that most external evaluations and assessments have found the results of this lengthy effort in state transformation to be disappointing (see World Bank (WB) 2005).

In order to revitalise the reform efforts, the Ministry of Public Sector Reform (MPSR) was established to facilitate and coordinate future government efforts. The overall objective of the Public Sector Reform is “to deliver prompt, efficient and cost-effective public services to improve service delivery, facilitate good governance, provide the enabling environment for private sector development and to improve human capital development of public sector employees”. The overall public sector reforms include some 22 key reforms of which decentralisation is considered one. They are briefly summarised in the following box.

Box 2: Key GoG public sector reform initiatives

1. Civil Service Reforms	11. Subvented Agencies
2. Service Delivery Improvement	12. National Governance Programme
3. Records Management - Storage and Retrieval of Information	13. Ghana Central Governance Project
4. Public Sector Pay Policy and Pension Reform	14. Land Administration Project
5. Restructuring CMAs and SMAs	15. Forestry Sector Development Project 2
6. Decentralisation	16. Business Law Reform
7. Development of Communication Enhancement Programme	17. Business Registration Reform Programme
8. Information and Communication Technology	18. Justice Sector Reform Programme
9. Public Financial Management	19. Private Sector Development Strategy
10. Support to Judicial Training	20. Institutional Reform - Ministry of Road Transport
	21. Trade Sector Support Programme - Ministry of Trade & Industry
	22. Energy Sector Reforms

Source: Decentralisation Policy Review, Final report , 02/2007

After initial institutional reviews, the Ministry of Public Sector Reform (MoPSR) focused on developing Customer Charters, setting out service standards, compliance monitoring, sanctions and complaint procedures for 12 MDAs. Furthermore, 10 districts have been identified for piloting. The Customer Charters are presently in the final stage of development.

The MoPSR is basically creating a support facility, guiding and servicing other public institutions in reforming public service. The ministry is only working as facilitator and has no

implementing authority. Motivation of the different MDAs has to come from the media and the public in addition to internal drivers. MoPSR can deal with local activities only when it has already been decided to decentralise by the MDA in question, and pilot cases will solely be of guidance to district assemblies. As decisions on decentralisation are the responsibility of the MoLGRDE, the MoPSR cannot push the case of better public service locally.

Implementation of the sub-component “Decentralisation” is still very much in the initial stages and no clear outputs can be reported on. Furthermore, disbursements have so far been very low.

3.1.2 Decentralisation

In a broader sense of public sector reform one has also to elaborate on Decentralisation reform initiatives embodied in the National Decentralisation Action Plan (NDAP). **Decentralisation** is a core element⁶ in second-generation reforms throughout Sub-Sahara Africa (SSA) and is often associated with increased voice and accountability by bringing governance closer to beneficiaries. **It has been a central element in public sector reform strategy since 1992 and is enshrined in the national Constitution.**

The policy seeks to establish decentralised administration through the transfer of authority, functions, means and competence from the Central Government (MDAs) to sub-national institutions such as the Regional Co-ordinating Councils and the District Assemblies, so as to enhance the capacity of the public sector to plan, manage and monitor social, spatial and economic development.⁷

Nielsen (2005) concludes in his assessment of progress in decentralisation that in Ghana, significant progress has been made in terms of establishing the legal framework as envisaged in the 1992 Constitution, the detailed Local Government Act of 1993, and, most recently, the Local Government Services Act, 2003. **However, implementation remains a challenge and the policy framework has remained weak until the development of the National Decentralization Action Plan (NDAP).** Still, the issues remain of building a national level coalition to implement the plan, and, particularly, of persuading decentralised Ministries to buy into the process.

According to Freeman (2005), “a major continuing constraint to decentralization in Ghana is the ability of decentralized Ministries to side-step planning and control by the regional and district bodies of the MLGRD. Decentralization has been also been unable to exert any direct impact on the quality of public services delivered at the local level.”

An in-depth description of the decentralisation process in Ghana is available in Thematic Paper 1.

3.2 Civil society and independent governance institutions

Civil society in Ghana involves broad citizen participation, covering churches, local and national NGOs, worker unions, organised student bodies and community based organisations (CBOs). There are over 1,200 NGOs registered with the Ministry of Manpower Youth and Employment. GAPVOD was set up in 1980 as the national umbrella organisation with a membership of over 250 NGOs located across Ghana.

⁶ The Public Financial Management Reform Programme (PUFMARP) has identified the MTEF and Fiscal Decentralisation as key components of the public sector reforms.

⁷ NDAP: Towards the Sector-wide approach for decentralisation Implementation in Ghana, MLGRD, Accra 2003

Civil society, on the whole, does not (yet) have a major influence in Ghana. The most influential actors within the Ghanaian context are the military, the executive and the donor community. The donor community is often understood as part of state institutions because of the close collaboration between the state and the donor community, particularly with reference to development policies. Civil society organisations such as the media, trade unions and international NGOs, as well as business associations, have some, although limited, influence on Ghanaian society.⁸

There are very limited financial resources available to most CSOs in Ghana and many rely on foreign funding for their activities. Collaboration between civil society and bilateral or multilateral donors appears to be on a case by case basis and rather driven by business motives. However, this assertion is debatable since some donors seek out CSOs to undertake specific assignments and information gathering. In fact, both donors and CSOs benefit from each other in the process. The limited resource base of CSOs also restricts their ability to build their own organisational and institutional capacity.

Many of civil society's structural deficiencies relate to limited capacity within the whole sector. In order to address this problem, CSOs should improve their financial management and reporting, information technology and advocacy, strengthen the role of umbrella organisations, and improve networking and information exchange among CSOs and other sectors, such as the media. Ghanaian CSOs need to adopt innovative methods of fundraising and resource mobilisation to supplement what they receive from their traditional donors. CSOs should improve their capacity to make use of existing institutional channels to influence policy-making and hold government accountable. Stronger advocacy commitment can help CSOs succeed in convincing government that civil society's involvement is crucial to ensure equitable development.⁹

The relationship between CSOs and government has evolved from limited interaction and discord during the early days of the 1992 Constitution to increasing engagement (through the insistence of the World Bank and other donor partners) over the past decade. In 1993, the Government drafted a bill to regulate NGOs. Though it was not enacted into law, many CSOs and NGOs protested the bill, which led to a straining of relations between Government and NGOs. It was at the end of 1999 that Government and NGOs decided to undertake a more constructive dialogue by establishing the joint National Consultative Group to resolve the issues. The launching of the GPRS in 2000 led to an opening up of the space for dialogue between civil society and Government. The GPRS process strengthened the collaboration between Government and civil society particularly through the implementation of projects under the Village Infrastructure Project (VIP) and Social Investment Fund (SIF) which were implemented by NGOs and CBOs at the district and grassroots level.

Overall, capacity development of Ghanaian civil society seems very much donor-driven.

3.3 Private sector

In the open market economy, the most reliable indicator of private sector capacity (or incapacity) is its growth in terms of profit generation and further development. In this context, doubtlessly, also the stories of failure have a positive impact on healthy economic development (in terms of not allowing unviable and uncompetitive companies to survive on the market) However, this does not mean resigning on (well-tailored and well-targeted) capacity development in the private sector. In this context, capacity development through the

⁸ Darkwa, Akosua, Amponsah, Nicholas and Evans, Gyampoh (2006): Civil society in a changing Ghana. An assessment of the current state of civil society in Ghana.

⁹ Ibid

promotion of an enabling environment for private sector activities – rather than targeting the private sector directly – is perhaps one of the most promising approaches.

While the political transition towards a market-led economy started already in the 1980s, it was not until the ‘Vision 2020’ of 1994, presenting the vision of Ghana as middle-income country in 2020 by doubling income per capita through improved public sector efficiency, introduction of Value Added Tax (VAT) and increased emphasis on private sector production, that the private sector was clearly singled out as a major motor of economic growth. Starting in 1996, the private sector became involved in the hearings of the new system of economic planning, establishing one and five-year plans for eventual approval of the National Development Planning Commission (NDPC), and when in 2002, work on the first Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS) was initiated, the focus on the private sector as the driver of economic growth and poverty reduction became explicit. With GPRS II 2006-09 from 2005 and its increased emphasis on a strategy of economic growth, the private sector’s priority role came even more to the forefront, in full harmony with the presidential announcement of ‘the golden age of business’.

In July 2004, the Private Sector Development Strategy (PSDS) was launched under the coordination of the Ministry for Private Sector Development, with support from donors headed by DFID and Danida. The PSDS is the central framework for GoG interventions for private sector development and for the creation of an enabling business environment. It includes a five-year action plan with a number of reform initiatives that Ghana aims to undertake in order to achieve the government’s declared goal of “sustainable, equitable and widespread private sector-led growth throughout Ghana”.

A lengthy dialogue process between GoG and donors as well as within the donor group led to the formulation of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between GoG and 12 donors, which was signed on 9 June 2005. The MoU is designed to cater for both donors able to finance jointly with others and donors who can only provide Technical Assistance (TA). The donors ended up in three groupings: Pooled fund donors (DFID, World Bank and Danida), aligned donors (all donors that could not engage in joint financing) and sector budget support (for the European Union (EU) that could not undertake pooled funding). Disbursements to the Pooled Fund are conditional upon positive assessment of performance against planned actions, and are to be effected half-yearly, based on approved requests from Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning (MoFEP).

In its Programme Document, the Danida-supported Business Sector Programme Support (BSPS) summarises the main obstacles to business development in Ghana at the time: “It is widely acknowledged that the current environment for business development in Ghana is difficult, hampering unfolding of the employment potential of the private sector. During the preparations of BSPS, the difficult circumstances of private business in the country were repeatedly highlighted. Some of the main obstacles identified are:

- Many laws and regulations are outdated, complex, overlapping or mutually conflicting;
- Administration of the laws is inadequate, caused by bureaucratic systems and administrative constraints;
- Lack of access to credit and capital is especially hindering the growth of micro and small enterprises;
- Venture capital is difficult to obtain, hampering the further expansion of medium and large companies;
- Ghanaian enterprises find it difficult to penetrate the international and regional markets due to unfavourable international trade conditions and poor product quality;

- Inadequate infrastructure, especially unreliable service from public utilities, result in production losses and high production costs;
- Inefficient system for resolution of commercial disputes causing prolonged disagreements and uncertain dispute settlements;
- Insufficient attention to research and development, training and retraining, and cost control.

BSPS has been designed with the intention to overcome some of the constraints.” The rationale for BSPS is therefore capacity development and, in particular, training in public MDAs as well as in private organisations and at all levels of responsibility.

3.4 Sector-specific capacity development initiatives

The World Bank (2005) examines capacity development experience in four sectors - education, health, roads and public expenditure/public sector reform - and in three dimensions - institutional, organisational and human capacity development. There have been major initiatives since the early 1990s to improve the capacity of the public sector and the quality of public services:

- **Organisational change:** Two significant initiatives were undertaken: (i) the creation in the mid-90s of semi-autonomous “subvented” agencies to manage service delivery - the Ghana Health Service, the Ghana Education Service and the Ghana Highway Authority, and (ii) The National Institutional Reform Program (NIRP) to redesign, streamline or privatize up to 50 government agencies.
- **Institutional Development:** The principal initiatives to improve policies, procedures and the “rules of the game” included:
 - o the decentralisation of government authority to the District level,
 - o introduction of performance-based budgeting,
 - o reform of central government functions, including integrated management information systems,
 - o improvement of civil service human resource management policy,
 - o a new public service pay and incomes policy,
 - o reform of public procurement, including contracting out of responsibility for some public services such as road construction and maintenance to the private sector
- **Human Resource Development:** The rapid expansion of education and health services and the introduction of new public sector management systems for budgeting, management information, procurement, contract management and other functions required significant investment in human resource capacity. This included professional development for groups such as doctors, nurses, teachers, managers, and engineers and skills development for more than 100,000 civil servants, especially teachers.

Each sector developed an explicit reform agenda and related capacity development programmes. But, **there was no attempt to integrate these efforts into an explicit capacity development strategy for the economy as a whole despite the mutual dependency of public sector and sector-level reforms.**

Roads, construction and rehabilitation have been the centrepiece of the government’s investment budget throughout the decade, even though transport has never been described as a ‘pillar’ of Ghana’s development strategy or identified as part of a strategy for accelerating growth and reducing poverty. The basic goals of the roads sector in the past ten years has been to rebuild and better maintain the primary road network of 14,000km, the

feeder road network of about 24,000km and the urban network of 2,400km, all of which had fallen into disrepair. In the mid-1990s, only about 45% of the primary road network was in 'good condition'. This deteriorated to only about 30% in 2003, largely because of the lack of maintenance of the unpaved road network.

In 1997, the principal means for promoting better management of the roads sector was to create a new organisational structure - the semi-autonomous Ghana Highway Authority (GHA) - and to encourage private sector participation in road construction and maintenance. In addition, modernized procurement procedures in the sector formed the basis for a new public procurement law. The Road Fund was made more independent.

In health, the strategic goals of the health system throughout the period have been to: (i) increase access to health services, (ii) improve quality of health services, (iii) enhance efficiency, especially for planning, management and administration, (iv) improve health financing, and (v) foster partnerships outside the health sector.

The means for achieving these objectives involved significant organisational, institutional and human resource capacity building, including (i) creating the semiautonomous Ghana Health Service (GHS), (ii) decentralising service delivery and management functions, and (iii) providing significant professional development and training opportunities for health workers. Expanding access and improving quality required significant expansion of training and professional development. Even then, skilled professionals are in short supply due to a continued emigration of skilled professionals. There are said to be more Ghanaian doctors abroad than in the country. Four hundred nurses leave Ghana annually. The total number of health professionals in Ghana has declined by about 25 percent in the past decade - from about 1,000 to 800 doctors and 12,000 to 9,000 nurses.

The major innovation in the sector was the introduction of a coordinated approach to external funding - the Sector-wide Approach (SWAp). The donor community supported the full programme and budget of the Ministry of Health, with annual agreements on the future programme of work and reviews of the previous years' accomplishments. This was the first such effort in Ghana and a significant success. Accomplishments include:

- Improved financial management, reporting and accountability, including greater decentralisation to the District level;
- Reported improvements in physical infrastructure;
- Improvements in some health outcomes;
- Timelier donor financial flows.

In education, the priorities have been similar to health: (i) expand access and make access more equitable; (ii) reduce the length of pre-university education; (iii) improve pedagogic efficiency and raise the quality and relevance of educational outcomes; (iv) contain and partially recover costs; and (5) enhance sector management and budgeting procedures. The 1992 Constitution mandated free universal primary education by 2005, which accentuated the need for more teachers.

In tertiary education, reforms initiated in the early 1990s aimed at restructuring the tertiary education system, increasing the contribution of the private sector and income generation for the funding of tertiary education, improving efficiency of resource use, achieving greater balance between the output of tertiary institutions and national development requirements, and improved access to tertiary education with an increase in the proportion of women.

According to the World Bank (2005), in public sector and public financial management, as indicated above, the public service in Ghana is inefficient but relatively honest. A review of public sector performance conducted by the NIRP in 1997 found:

- Lack of staff and skills in critical areas such as policy analysis, macroeconomic analysis, financial analysis, information systems, general management and planning. Lack of key skills that would make it impossible to implement change;
- Inadequate match between resources and policies. There was very little prioritization conducted within sectors and amongst the different sectors;
- Inadequate incentives: Staff motivation was low because of poor remuneration;
- Lack of alignment between deliverables on the one hand and structures and systems on the other;
- Poor human resource systems: Managers in public service were constrained in their ability to determine staff mix.

The reform agenda as set out in the Public Sector Re-invention and Modernization Strategy for Ghana prepared by NIRP in 1997 had the following elements:

- Re-orient the public service into a performance-based system. Shift in emphasis from monitoring inputs to monitoring outputs and outcomes.
- Rationalize appointment and promotion systems.
- Introduce a uniform salary structure based on tasks performed rather than position.
- Introduce output-based processes and systems, e.g. performance based budgeting.

The institutional reform effort was supported by the World Bank-financed Public Sector Management Reform Project (PSMRP), with a complimentary effort by the DFID on civil service reform.

Overall, according to the World Bank (2005), at the service delivery end of the spectrum, the Ministry of Health has apparently seen more improvement while results in the capacity and quality of service in the education system have been very mixed, with more being achieved in tertiary education than in basic, primary and secondary education. One criticism of the donor-supported sector-specific capacity development programmes has been their concentration on strengthening planning and management systems at headquarters with fewer resources and much less impact at the classroom or health post level.

Moreover, sector-specific capacity development support in Ghana has been rated most effective (Walters 2005, WB 2005) when it is operationally focused on specific MDAs whose mandates and functions are clearly specified and when it has limited goals. For these reasons, the most successful sector-specific capacity development programming has been in smaller and more focused MDAs.

Finally, sector-specific initiatives have reportedly suffered from the absence of cross-linkages between up-stream efforts to reform the administration and pay of the public service as a whole and actions directed at capacity development in a single sector or agency.

There is a continuing commitment to providing support to efforts to build capacity and to transform government services in Ghana on the part of multilateral and bilateral aid agencies. There is also a strong movement to better donor co-ordination either through the Multi-Donor Budget Support Program or through sector-specific donor-government coordination groups.

3.5 Conclusion: How has capacity of organisations and authorities to deliver appropriate services evolved in Ghana?

This section addresses Level 1 of the TOR, i.e. it reflects on development of the capacity of organisations and authorities to deliver appropriate services during the period of investigation, and on the role the international donor community played in this context. In other words, it asks: What have all donor efforts contributed to capacity development in Ghana?

Ghana benefits from a very high level of external donor involvement and is highly aid dependent¹⁰. Besides providing funding, donors have also supported debates, workshops and roundtables, and enabled significant civil society input into numerous upgradings of legislation. So there exist positive developments in terms of strengthening of GoG's capacity. Progress is evident in the domain of Public Financial Management (PFM), in particular the updating of the Audit Service Act (2000), the adoption of the Financial Administration Act (2003), the Procurement Act (2003) and the Internal Audit Agency Act (2003). There is also an increase in general PFM capacities, as for instance reported in the HIPC-AAP exercise (2004), which indicated improvements in the quality of budget preparation, financial commitment and expenditure control, reporting and auditing.

Despite these positive trends, there is a shortage of expertise in critical areas of public administration such as (i) policy analysis, (ii) strategic planning and (iii) financial management. In a way this has become an endemic problem of the public sector. Service has in consequence grown weak, with characteristically low morale. It is clear that a weak public administration system poses a great threat to government's capacity to deliver development to its citizens and pushes the State down a path of ultimate dysfunction. The policy of restoring the public service in response to the national development imperatives was pursued with a sense of mission in 2004.¹¹

The subsequent public sector reform(s) sought to overhaul the central government structures and organisation so as to make the central machinery of government more efficient, effective, and private sector-friendly.¹²

The often-voiced concern over the GoG's capacity and its effect on the efficient supply of public services often have to do with the distribution of available capacity. Areas where capacity could be increased at very low cost but with major returns are sometimes neglected. This would greatly expand the productivity of government expenditure, with substantial returns in terms of macroeconomic performance. For instance, the overall productivity of the government could be improved with no overall increase in central government expenditure if some capacity increases took place in the regions at the expense of Accra and central government.¹³

Freeman (2005) summarises Ghana's efforts at public sector reform and capacity development since at least 1994 as "both overly ambitious and too broad, with inadequate sequencing in their design and implementation. In essence, Ghana appears to have entered into national programmes of capacity development and reform of the state which outstripped the level of commitment and support available from the executive, the parliament, political parties and effectively organised interest groups in civil society. ... Ghana has appeared to pursue a strategy of comprehensive transformation of the state without the necessary broad base of political and social support. The documents reviewed for the case study argue strongly for a more focused, more carefully sequenced, and more modest strategy of public sector reform and capacity development in Ghana."

Based on this analysis, Freeman (2005) suggests three re-entry points to support capacity development in Ghana:

- Decentralisation, but with a clearer focus on supporting regional and district level bodies engaged in direct service delivery in key social areas that might impact on

¹⁰ See also Thematic Paper 1.

¹¹ Ghana: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Annual Progress Report, IMF, 2006

¹² Ghana: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Annual Progress Report, IMF;2004

¹³ APRM Ghana Country Review Report, 2005

poverty and do have a more direct link to stakeholders. A prerequisite for this to work is that the MDAs providing social services are effectively integrated into the decentralised structure. This suggests the MoLGRDE would be a key partner;

- Services to private enterprise either through direct services such as customs and excise or through regulatory agencies responsible for (as examples) telecommunications, banking, transport, infrastructure, and energy. This would aim at linking a capacity development initiative to the growth in effective demand from the private sector and could have the collateral result of accelerating the growth of the private sector.
- “Direct strengthening of parliamentary bodies and over-sight mechanisms. While the medium term impact of parliamentary democracy was reportedly a weakening of political support for reform, this may be partly a result of the relative under-allocation of resources to the parliament, and its committees and the weaknesses of final audit bodies. If parliamentarians have more financial and professional resources they may begin to exert a much stronger influence on the budget process. This should include technical assistance to parliamentary investigative staff and committees.”

Furthermore, Freeman is of the opinion that the level of effort formerly provided to reform structures and organisational roles at a central level and direct support to improved capacity for service delivery at field level need to be re-balanced, based on his analysis that “The past decade has seen limited results from a strategy focused on planning, budgeting and central office functions with apparently less emphasis on field effectiveness in service delivery.”

Walters (2005) has examined the different aid modalities and the role of donors and their impact on capacity development in Ghana. He concludes that the Multi-Donor Budget Support (MDBS) programme has had a positive impact on the GoG’s capacity to manage predictable aid flows. He also reports that MDBS (in conjunction with other capacity development programmes and projects) has helped build the capacity of government to plan and co-ordinate. In particular, he contends the notion that because they participate in MDBS the planning, human resource management and financial management capacities of the Ministries of Education and Health are more advanced than those of other Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs).

While support by MDBS may have had a positive impact on capacities in the Ministries of Education and Health, it is important to note that planning, human resource management, donor co-ordination and implementation capacities in the Ministry of Health were already being supported under the existing SWAp, prior to the advent of MDBS. The Ministries of Health and Education also hold annual planning and review summits in consultation with both donors and civil society organisations. Walters argues that MDBS, through the use of disbursement triggers linked to priority areas of institutional strengthening, has the potential to be more effective than project support in assisting Ghana to develop capacity. He also makes a case for the added benefit of placing responsibility for accountability and performance with the executive and parliament rather than donors.

Other evaluations of Direct Budget Support and Sector-Wide Approaches have questioned the ability of these aid modalities to contribute effectively to capacity development. The World Bank (2005) notes: “There appears to be an inherent problem of building human resource capacity through sector-wide or budget support. Traditionally, a great deal of effective capacity building was done informally by experienced task managers working closely with technical counterparts over an extended period of time on specific issues. The sector wide or programmatic approach diminishes these opportunities for several reasons. First,

the whole dialogue shifts from the technical level to the policy level. Second, there is less project supervision of specific investment activities.”

On the whole, there is reason to believe that overall donor support for capacity development, encompassing support to changes in overall policies and the related institutional frameworks, has been helpful in at least a good number of cases, and has contributed to improving framework conditions for more effective aid delivery. So, depending on the sector, capacity development efforts are at least partly bearing fruit. Consequently, the need for external technical assistance has fallen, although it is still required in a number of areas.

Effectiveness of implementation of the various policy frameworks is, however, still lacking, owing not least to problems of staff attraction and retention in the relevant government services. Also, the fact that decentralisation efforts are far behind schedule considerably reduces the potential impact of aid. Without the political will to implement the required decentralisation effectively and to put in place the required resources and organisational structures, the impact of combined donor efforts will remain limited.

4 Danida's policies related to capacity development: An innovative donor at the forefront of policy guidance for capacity development

Long before the Paris Declaration put an emphasis on capacity development, Denmark has considered this dimension as a key element in its development assistance programme, and its strategies and guidelines have emphasised capacity development support. As its aid moved from a project to a programmatic approach, the focus on capacity development support has moved from a focus on individuals or individual organisations to developing institutional or organisational capacity at sector level, or at government level through support to various reform endeavours. At the same time, given the lack of a comprehensive conceptual framework to analyse capacity development, including methodologies to assess the impact of capacity development support, Denmark decided to embark on a large development and learning exercise in this field in 2002 (see following boxes).

Box 3: Denmark's incremental approach to analysing capacity development

A step-by-step approach has been taken to test a methodology for capacity development impact evaluation. Each step produced a separate working paper, available on the Danida website. The steps were as follows:

1. 2002: development of an analytical framework to evaluate the impact of Danish capacity development support to public sector organisations in the context of sector programme support.
2. 2003: establishment of an overview of the existing Danish support to capacity development. This was the first assessment of Danish support to capacity development. The study also tested the relevance of the impact evaluation approach suggested in the analytical framework. It covered 15 sector programme supports and three interventions funded under the environment, peace and stability mechanism.
3. 2003: development of a draft methodology for evaluating capacity development; this suggests 15 steps to assess capacity development support.
4. 2004/05: publication of a general report describing a pragmatic approach to donor support for public sector capacity development. This report was followed in 2005 by an introduction to a result-oriented approach to capacity change focusing on the potential constraints and the realistic options for changing and enhancing organisations' capacity.
5. 2005: field-testing of the proposed methodology in Ghana, which led to recommendations for adjustments to the analytical framework and the methodology.
6. 2006: a guidance note on Danish support for capacity development was issued by the Technical Advisory Services. It aims to translate the theory into practice in the field.

Source: OECD/ Development Assistance Committee (DAC) 2007

The 2003 review of the existing Danish support to capacity development (Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA), 2003b) found that while capacity development was referred to as a key objective in Danish public sector support programmes, the concept of capacity development and the way to operationalise it remained unclear. In particular:

1. Danish interventions had generally weak analytical underpinnings;
2. the capacity development support was strongly focused on the technical, functional aspects of organisations (skills development, general management training, structures, procedures and mandates) while there was minor attention to the external context and political issues;
3. targets, outputs and indicators were generally not specified and only to a limited degree linked to specified output/outcome changes of the recipient organisation;
4. consensus with partners on how to evaluate the results of the capacity development support was rarely established prior to implementation.

Box 4: A methodology to support capacity development

The framework and the methodology developed by Danida both emphasise the importance of external and internal factors, and adopt a broad institutional approach to the analysis of capacity and capacity development in organisations. The analytical framework is based on four key propositions:

1. organisations are seen as open systems with an “inside” and an “outside”;
2. organisational analysis should include both formal and informal aspects;
3. capacity development support can be classified as either internal (“push strategies”) or external (“pull-strategies”), and either predominantly functional or predominantly political; and
4. recipient commitment and capacity to change is essential for success of capacity development support.

The analytical framework therefore suggested that capacity development support can be given in four major ways, depending of its focus (factors internal or external to the organisation in question) and on its approach (capacity problems regarded as functionally or politically rooted; see Table 2).

The framework then identifies key factors for successful capacity development support: competitive pressure and performance demands on the organisation; the possible gaps between the formal and the informal organisation; the actual incentive structures functioning in the organisation; the scope of required change; the commitment of stakeholders to the change process; the availability of sufficient recipient capacity to manage and lead capacity development; the balance between pull and push elements in the support for CD; the options for producing some quick, visible results to deepen commitments; and the timing and process of intervention and support.

Source: Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development / Development Assistance Committee - OECD/DAC 2007

Initially, the methodological exercise was undertaken jointly with other Nordic agencies. However, overcoming difficulties in the joint exercise, Denmark developed its own guidelines, though it continues to work with other donors to develop common guidelines and implement joint capacity assessments, in line with the commitments of the Paris Declaration. Danish efforts to progress its agenda on capacity development have been beneficial for other donors. OECD/DAC (2007) invites Denmark to “continue to broaden the approach to other donors in line with the DAC good practice paper, and to work with them to address the challenge of translating the approach to capacity development into the programmes, with a strong link with governance and institutional support. In doing so, it will need to ensure the strong involvement of partner countries.”

In order to help translate its theoretical approaches into implementation in the field, Danida drew on all the lessons learned through the above process to issue a guidance note. Its objective is to provide staff at embassies and headquarters with a simple assessment tool

for the planning and preparation of capacity development interventions in programmes and projects supported by Denmark.

The note insists on the need to conduct a thorough institutional capacity analysis before preparing a new programme. It proposes a methodology with a step-by-step approach, corresponding to the identification, formulation and appraisal phases of a project. The focus should be on individual organisations that are part of Danish-supported programmes, with a specific assessment for each organisation supported. The impact of capacity development support should be measured against the outputs delivered by each organisation, and benchmarks and targets should be designed for changes in these outputs. Both internal and external factors will be considered when analysing organisational change. In addition, both “political” factors, such as commitment to change processes, and “functional-rational” factors, such as legal mandates, must be considered. A framework for analysing factors was designed as below.

Box 5: Four options for organisational change

	Functional-rational dimension	Political dimension
Internal dimension	<p><i>Getting the job done:</i> focuses on changes in task-and-work system within the organisation</p> <p>Most donor interventions have been in this category, which includes skill training, organisational restructuring, human resource development, etc.</p>	<p><i>Addressing power relations:</i> focuses on internal changes in power and authority distribution and pursuit of different interests</p> <p>Interventions include hiring and promotions based on merit, building international coalitions for change, introducing performance-based payments, actively discouraging rent-seeking</p>
External dimension	<p>Creating an “enabling environment”: focuses on how changes in external factors and incentives will affect the task-and-work system dimension of organisational capacity</p> <p>May include protecting certain functions (e.g. internal revenue, customs, central banks) from political influence and poor working conditions, ensuring external audits, focusing on outputs</p>	<p><i>Forcing change in internal power relations:</i> focuses on how changes in external factors and incentives will affect the dimension of power and authority distribution, conflict and pursuit of different interests in the organisation</p> <p>Examples include the strengthening of civil society organisations or of political accountability, building external coalitions for change and strengthening the media’s watchdog role</p>

Source: MFA (2006): *Guidance note on Danish support for Capacity development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen*

According to OECD/DAC 2007, one challenge for Denmark is to link sector support to capacity development with support to governance, which has so far been concentrated at the organisational level. “Thus, Denmark needs to consider what it is doing at the institutional level when preparing a sector programme. This would ensure close linkages and interactions between the governance programme and activities stimulating organisational capacity change, including, for instance, identifying the key roles of national actors or introducing performance-based incentives. This points to the need for better analysis of the ‘political economy’ as part of the political dimension in the Danish analytical framework. It will be important that the new governance strategy being prepared clearly establishes the link between these different approaches.”

5 Capacity development in Danida support to Ghana

This section tries to provide answers to the question “To what extent has Danish assistance contributed to the development of organisational and institutional capacity in the supported sectors and sustained improved performance of these in Ghana?” It further brings together the various analyses made in the other thematic papers under the heading “capacity development”, and tries to cross-analyse and compare respective efforts, successes and failures. It also provides additional analysis of capacity development efforts not explicitly dealt with in other Thematic Papers.

5.1 Capacity development in the Country Programmes

In the 1990s, there still existed in Ghana a three-year plan for technical assistance as an integral part of the Public Investment Plan. Its aim was to ensure that technical assistance was planned, carried out and supervised as effectively as possible. In 1991-92, 71% of technical assistance came from abroad while 29% was supplied by Ghana itself. In the three-year plan for 1993-95, the respective shares were 51% foreign and 49% national. This complied with the Government's policy of making increased use of the national resource base wherever possible. At this time there was still a particular need for international advisers such as engineers, agronomists and economists, but the secondment of bilateral Danida advisers in Ghana had been limited. By the end of 1993, only three such advisers were expected in post. The use of local consultants and advisers was confined mainly to project feasibility studies, but some were also employed in Danida-financed programmes.

The analysis part of the 1993 - 1997 strategy focused very much on building the administrative capacity of the entire public sector and local authorities to plan and monitor projects to allow “better and speedier utilisation of funds to be put at the disposal of individual districts following decentralisation. ... The Government openly recognises the problems surrounding deficiencies in administrative capacity and ability, and has shown great willingness to enter into a dialogue with donors on the issue. It accepts donors' wishes and demands of foreign advisers and other forms of technical assistance to be attached to projects. The country's extensive dependence on foreign advisers may make it difficult, however, to ensure the sustainability of assistance. This requires a continued dialogue with the Government to ensure that 'ownership rights' to development projects are transferred as early as possible.” Overall, the strategy aimed at strengthening the various sectors' capacity to independently plan and implement projects.

The 1998 – 2002 Strategy identified a long-term need for assistance to develop the public sector's capacity to effectively implement sector plans and reduce poverty, especially that of the Ministry of Finance which, irrespective of the sector, was seen to play a key role in coordinating contributions from donors. Denmark endeavoured to strengthen the capacity of the Ministry of Finance. However, the Strategy was rather optimistic as it envisaged that, with sector institutions strengthened, much of Danish assistance would be extended as budgetary support.

The 2004 - 2008 Strategy still considered that the capacity for “implementing the GPRS is limited in most sectors. The effectiveness of the GPRS could be jeopardised if this is not adequately addressed at an early stage. For the same reason, from 2004, as a contributor to the Multi Donor Budget Support mechanism and its Technical Assistance Pool, Denmark will seek to promote capacity development of the relevant institutions, most importantly the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning and the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development through the Thematic Programme for Good Governance and Human Rights. ... A main priority is capacity development of Ghanaian civil society organisations in the area of good governance, decentralisation, conflict prevention, education,

gender equality and advocacy of rights, as envisaged by the GPRS”. This is coherent with the target of “continuing to build national capacity to enhance sustainability and facilitate management of aid flows” that the Strategy spells out.

Although “Human Resource Development” represents Pillar III of the GPRS, the chapters are relatively silent about “capacity development”, indicating only that “the main goal of Human Resource Development in the GPRS II is to ensure that Ghana produces a knowledgeable, well-trained and healthy population with adequate capacity to support the accelerated economic growth and poverty reduction” (APR 2006). Among the broad policy areas identified as the key pillars of the country’s comprehensive human resource development were education, access to health care, safe water and sanitation, and last but not least “Training and Skills Development”. However, the latter only focuses on training and marketable skills among youth.

5.2 How has capacity development been addressed by Danida in Ghana?

As indicated in the “Introduction”, this evaluation considers Danida’s capacity-building activities in three areas:

1. developing public sector / government capacity for effective and efficient service delivery, while at the same time supporting organisational changes;
2. developing the capacity of organisations seeking to influence policy changes and empower civil society – this mainly concerns Danida support to NGOs, CSOs and IGIs;
3. developing private sector capacity, either through assistance to Financial Sector Support, to the Private Sector Development Programme and to the BSPS, or also in the framework of support to the other sectors where enhancing private sector capacity partly played an important role.

It must be emphasised that, apart from the general level, each Country Programme usually envisaged a variety of capacity-building measures at the level of the stakeholders involved in any of the selected support sectors. In this context, OECD/DAC 2007 stated that Danish support to capacity development has been focusing mainly on building government capacity, rather than strengthening local civil society as seems to be the case for Nepal. The Ghana CPE, however, found that Danish support to capacity development in Ghana did not only target government institutions; Danida support went into civil society strengthening, not necessarily to grassroots organisations but to intermediaries that advocate for civil society rights, transparency, accountability, public-private dialogue, and so on. On the other hand, there is definitely “a need to ensure an appropriate balance between these two levels of support in each context, based on an analysis of specific situations”, an OECD statement fully supported by the evaluation.”

From the existing budgets, it is impossible to derive any realistic figure for the amount that Danida has either directly or indirectly devoted to capacity development. Given the fact that only in the transport and energy sector have considerable direct investments in infrastructure been made (including the associated design and supervision work), the team assumes that most of the remainder went, in one form or the other, into capacity-building efforts. In general, capacity development can be provided for final beneficiaries such as women managing a water point, small-scale local contractors (e.g. transport), intermediaries intended to deliver services to the final beneficiaries, or for administrators in the public sector and managers and policy-makers in a position to promote or make changes. Danida has used all these facets in their various support programmes.

5.3 How relevant were Danida's capacity development measures to in-country needs?

Capacity development in the **health** sector has taken the form of training, equipment, infrastructural development and provision of short and long-term technical assistance. The HSSO has had long-term technical assistance. All these measures have been highly relevant. Also as highly relevant can be considered fellowships provided by Danida in the health sector, either as long- or short-term courses outside the country. Additionally, both short and long-term TAs in financial management, transport and support to the EMU have been relevant. The support has contributed to strengthening maintenance systems of health facilities in the country. Furthermore, the establishment of the Health Sector Support Office (HSSO) can be seen as having impacted positively on the building of the health sector's management capacity.

As for **water and sanitation**, Danida's intervention in the establishment of the Water Directorate and the improvement of capacity for policy development and harmonisation is relevant to the country's needs, as it has led to improved ministerial oversight in the water and sanitation sector, which has been recognised as a critical step in ensuring effective delivery of water and sanitation services. The development of capacities within the various WRIS institutions as well as WRC was required to ensure comprehensive water management in the country.

Moreover, CWSA's role as the facilitating agency for community water delivery required varying skills and capabilities, which Danida has been instrumental in establishing. Finally, capacity development embedded at the district and community levels were developed on the basis of assessed capacity needs and delivered by partner organisations

As for **transport**, considerable levels of technical assistance were provided by the various sector donors (including Danida) to MRT and road sector agencies in the 1990s. However, by 2000, reviews found that foreign technical assistance had 'consolidated or even increased' due to shortages in engineering and financial management personnel, needs for further training and loss of trained staff to the private sector. Although a few years later, there was some reduction in Foreign Technical Assistance (FTA) levels, this reduction was almost immediately offset by a new wave of technical assistance to 'new' issues of road safety, environment, gender and poverty reduction where, according to the Joint Evaluation of RSP, 2000 'technical assistance can give added value'. Continuing proposals for in-country training, whilst at face value being practical and logical, founder because they are not popular with staff who see overseas training as an incentive scheme as much as a training opportunity¹⁴. Danida is among the donors offering training in the home country. Unfortunately, the levels of residual capacity and assumption of function following departure of (usually well-resourced) technical assistance does not appear to be high.

Another example of high relevance is - in the broader field of Good Governance and Human Rights (**GGHR**) - the case of the Electoral Commission (EC) and Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice (CHRAJ) capacity development measures. Support to the EC comprised funding for training 280 District Electoral Officers and other staff in selected regional and district electoral offices for the 2004 Presidential and Parliamentary elections and the 2006 district assembly elections. The Judicial Service support proved to be a challenge in the sense that though the training was relevant to the needs of the judiciary its implementation became a problem. For example, the training component on Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) and ICT was very useful for the magistrates but usage of the skills was poor because there were no systems in place to support their

¹⁴ The ODICT programme was based upon the concept of in-country training. The lack of popularity for such in-country training was assessed to be a factor in the lack of engagement of agency staff.

newly acquired skills. This lesson has been factored into a new project design and serves as a lesson learnt for both Danida and the Project Implementation Unit (PIU) of the Judiciary.

In the field of **decentralisation**, in the early 2000s under Danida Support to District Assemblies (DSDA) II, training for the District Planning Coordinating Units (DPCUs) was generic and not sector specific, but still very relevant to the target groups' needs. Some training covered report writing and database management. At the sub-district level, staff were trained in book keeping, financial management and report writing. This gave them the basic skills to run the area councils.

Danida's aide-mémoire of May 2007 notes that while the support funds may enable CSOs to express demands and carry out lobbying campaigns, the results of such activities depend largely on the approach adopted by the Government and the Parliament in relation to civil society. The aide-mémoire further noted that Ghana's Research and Advocacy Programme (G-RAP) has supported the organisation of Research and Advocacy Organisation (RAO) conventions as a platform for dialogue between research and advocacy organisations and state representatives. However, these initiatives are not enough to support the development of a more responsive attitude by the state. A more encouraging example could be the Governance Issues Forum (GIFs) implemented by Institute of Democratic Governance (IDEG) through Danida support. In fact, it is another key example of the creation of fora for participation in decision making. The forum serves as a platform for CSOs to actively input into budgets at the national and district level. The GIFs fora have been instrumental in government's decision-making in the Youth Unemployment Programme.

As for the **Independent Governance Institutions** however, training was sector specific, e.g. training for CHRAJ by the Danish Ombudsman where staff from all regional and district offices of CHRAJ were trained. Parliamentary staff equally benefited from several relevant forms of training and capacity development initiatives with some undertaking long term courses such as MBAs.

Support to the Electoral Commission comprised funding for training 280 District Electoral Officers and other staff in selected regional and district electoral offices for the 2004 Presidential and Parliamentary elections and the 2006 district assembly elections. The Judicial Service support proved to be a challenge in the sense that though the training was relevant to the needs of the judiciary its application became a problem. So for example, the training component on ADR and ICTs was very useful for the magistrates but usage of the skills was poor because there were no systems in place to support the newly acquired skills of the magistrates. This lesson has been factored into a new project design and serves as a lesson learnt for both Danida and the PIU of the Judiciary.

Regarding the **private sector**, support for capacity-building in the financial sector contributed to the SAP of the ERP and later on to the Vision 2020 and the GPRS I, being thus clearly relevant in the drive for stabilization of the Ghanaian economy and furthering growth and poverty reduction in rural areas. The capacity development measures of the BSPS have either been part of the PSDS implementation process or they have been monitored and coordinated by its Oversight Committee. They have accordingly been fully relevant to Ghana's needs, as has been, for instance, the local contractor development in the road sector.

As for **gender**, gender mainstreaming is a fairly new concept and knowledge and skills in addressing such issues requires training in gender analysis tools and strategies. Support for training in gender mainstreaming is justified and commendable, as it covered issues such as understanding gender mainstreaming and analysis, which have been identified as important to strengthening capacity of organisations to mainstream gender effectively. E.g., with the support of the Gender Development Institute (GDI), training workshops and

conferences were held from 1999 to 2001 which brought together several NGOs requiring knowledge and skills in gender mainstreaming and analysis (the available reports do not provide definite figures on the number of participants). These training efforts were provided as part of Danida support to the GDI for effective gender networking. The fora also provided the opportunity to share ideas and challenges in gender mainstreaming in Ghana. Overall, all these measures were highly relevant since they were provided at a time of a national movement in favour of introducing gender and development (GAD) after several decades of the WID (Women in development) approach.

5.4 How did Danida consider capacity development issues in policy dialogue?

The most visible example of consideration of capacity development in policy dialogue seems to be the **gender**-related discussion. This might be even surprising, taking into account Danida's general emphasis and pro-activeness in relation to this topic. This having been said, the relative newness of the gender topic does not seem to be a sufficient explanation for this situation. In general, there is limited documentation on how Danida considered capacity development on gender in policy dialogue. However, there is evidence from discussions with donor representatives - all members of the Gender Theme Support Group (GEST) group - who confirm that since the mid 1990s, there has been much engagement with GoG on building capacity for gender mainstreaming. This has resulted in some attempts by GoG to ensure integration of gender concerns into sector policies, including the women in agricultural development (WIAD) strategy on gender, the Ministry of Health (MoH) draft policy on gender, and the finalisation of the Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs (MOWAC) policy document on gender including an implementation plan and strategy which was supported by donors including Danida. Through Danida's contribution, among others, organisations like International Needs Ghana (ING), Association of Women Lawyers (AWLA), Management AID (MAID), Friends of the Earth (FOE) and the MOWAC were in a position to handle their individual objectives as well as the general mandate to address critical gender issues.

In other sectors the consideration of capacity development seems to be more explicit. An example is the **health** sector. As for Danida support therein, the issues of capacity development are frequently discussed in the dialogue with the MOH. Other capacity development assistance discussed during the dialogue includes provision of post-graduate fellowships for health staff to either attend short courses or Masters Programmes in International health. Though one donor indicated that capacity development assistance has not always been welcomed by government, the general view was that MOH has been receptive to such support.

As for **water and sanitation**, the form and content of training has been a subject of discussion in both bilateral and multilateral dialogue between GoG and development partners. For instance, the balance between long-term Masters level training and more short-term skill development were often discussed with beneficiary institutions, resulting eventually in more emphasis being placed on skills development, even though a few higher degree programmes were sponsored.

In addition, the need for harmonised training content among different external support agencies in the sector was discussed frequently, leading to a situation where training manuals developed within the CWSA are increasingly being used as standard manuals for different DP-sponsored programme. Nevertheless, some external support agencies still conduct training based on their own training manuals.

The donor group on **decentralisation** confirms continuous dialogue on capacity development both at the national, regional and district levels, since all donors have components for capacity development built into their support to the GoG. According to DPs "significant

funding for capacity building and TA is available” and it is up to the Government to take up these offers.

Even from before the creation of the donor governance group, there are positive examples of close consultation between Danida and all levels of Ghanaian administration and civil society: The formulation of the DSDA programme involved extensive consultative sessions at the national, regional, district and sub-district levels. In addition, and unusually enough, the representatives of the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development (MLGRD), National Association of Local Authorities in Ghana (NALAG) and the District Assemblies (DAs) partnered with the consultants in executing the formulation assignment. At the district level, civil service staff, assembly members, sub-district staff and civil society representatives were involved in the consultation process to obtain a range of views. The dialogue with these stakeholders in the programme formulation at the district level greatly enriched the design phase, which lasted about six months. The draft document was validated by the stakeholders at both the national and regional level sessions.

Danida support to the MoLGRDE has always emphasised capacity development. A comprehensive capacity development programme was built into all programmes and projects. Projects documents made this quite clear from the beginning. Danida has made various options open to the ministry.

In the **transport** sector, (Danida’s) policy dialogue with GoG and sector institutions has included much discussion on capacity needs and institutions. However, capacity development in Ghana, which has tended to be ‘technical’ training combined with conventional technical assistance, has not delivered the expected levels of residual capacity. Sector institutions have long argued that the requisite capacity is already present in Ghana, that this latent capacity simply lacks the resources and tools to do the job, and that foreign technical assistance should therefore be phased out. Donor response has pointed out institutional and policy shortcomings which make for dysfunctional sectoral management whatever resources may be available. There is an element of truth in both arguments but, undoubtedly, a lack of policies and strategic goals make it difficult to effectively manage the sector.

In the **private sector**, the Financial Sector Support represents a constructive example of close cooperation with the BoG, regarding capacity development in the sector. In its third phase, the project was initiated through an exemplary participative approach, creating a sense of ownership and genuine understanding of the project’s objectives and the activities.

As for the **BSPS**, basically all four components assessed aim at the development of an enabling environment for the private sector through interventions, building capacity in both public and private sector institutions and organisations as well as indirectly in individual enterprises. Since the PSDS was launched in 2004, BSPS capacity development in public sector MDAs has been integrated in the joint PSDS implementation process and the component / sub-components enhancing capacity development in private sector organisations have been monitored by the PSDS Oversight Committee. Joint reviews of the PSDS activities are conducted every six months.

Issues surfacing at the joint reviews are taken up bilaterally with concerned MDAs, e.g., the issue of capacity development for Business Law Reform (BLR) at the Ministry of Justice (MoJ) and the fate of the Business Law Division (BLD), which was raised in a meeting between the review team and the MoJ at the latest joint review September 2007. Otherwise, during the reviews, implementing institutions and organisations are examined regarding capacity building developments.

5.5 How satisfied were trainees of all kinds with the Danida's capacity development measures?

Satisfaction of trainees very much depends upon at which point in time a survey is made, and whether satisfaction purely refers to the contents of the courses or also includes issues of application of the newly acquired knowledge in practice. Unfortunately, no representative surveys cutting across the sectors of Danida support are available. However, document reviews and numerous individual interviews during the evaluation allow for a number of general observations.

Taking the **health** sector as an example, career structures for technical and non-technical staff at MoH exists. However, there is no plan to ensure that the skills and knowledge acquired by trainees are immediately and effectively tapped. Despite the general satisfaction, most of the trainees become frustrated after returning from training programmes as they are unable to immediately apply the acquired skills and knowledge. Nevertheless, discussions with staff supported by Danida to undertake post-graduate courses revealed that most had been placed in positions of responsibility. In the UWR, for instance, seven of such beneficiaries are District Directors of Health Services, one is the Regional Coordinator of the National Health Insurance Scheme in the region and another is the acting Regional Training Officer. One of the beneficiaries in the Eastern region resumed his position as the District Manager of a mutual health insurance scheme on his return from a post-graduate course in South Africa. Discussions with some of these trainees revealed that the trainings had been very useful and that they are applying the acquired knowledge and skills to their present job.

It must be noted that job descriptions were prepared for staff in the UWR during the implementation of HSPS by Danida in the region. The Human Rights (HR) Division of the MOH has also developed job descriptions for all sector agency established posts and a new strategy document has also been developed. This move is a sign towards streamlining capacity development measures to make training more useful and beneficial to both the trainees and MOH.

Regarding **water and sanitation**, there was a generally high sense of appreciation of training received among professional staff of the CWSA, the WRIS and other government agencies. Staff interviewed in the WRIS in particular were very positive about the relevance and usefulness of both short-term skill development training received and the higher degree programmes pursued.

Similarly, community members highly commended the continuous capacity development activities incorporated into the programmes. In particular, the operations and maintenance programmes and leadership training for women were highly praised.

As for **transport**, satisfaction of trainees in the sector is generally good regarding technical content but low regarding possibilities of applying newly acquired knowledge. Training courses available are often not based on needs assessment, and training - especially courses abroad - is often used as an incentive (though its granting is not always related to good performance).

Neither for the **Financial Sector Support** nor for the **BSPS**, there appears to be an overall monitoring of the programmes' training activities. However, high scores of training courses and successful training activities are repeatedly stressed and praised by stakeholders, be it financial staff, the judges of the Commercial Court (CC), associations supported by Business Sector Advocacy Challenge Fund (BUSAC) or the PFIs and the service providers supported by Support Programme for Enterprise Empowerment and Development (SPEED) (see Section 5.3.4 in the TP on Private Sector).

A field with strong examples of positive trainee assessments would definitely be **GGHR**. A number of trainees spoken to agreed that Danida support for capacity development has been useful, in particular in setting up structures and systems that were developed under DSDA I & II support, but also under the GG&HRP support to the decentralisation sector. At the national level, the decentralisation secretariat confirms that the capacity development initiatives were useful. They comprised of selected study tours, short courses and international seminars which benefited both staff of the secretariat and of the ministry. Additionally, staff of the RPCUs and district assemblies state that training provided under Danida support was beneficial and useful. They note that Danida support came at a time when capacity development was just being introduced as concept. Nevertheless, some opinions stress that over time, capacity development initiatives became too project-based resulting in training fatigue in some districts. Consequently, this led to very limited improvements in some district assemblies.

With regard to the **IGIs**, training was sector-specific, such as for CHRAJ, where training was given by the Danish Ombudsman. Staff from all CHRAJ regional and district offices were trained and the Acting Commissioner confirms that this has led to an improvement of staff performance in all aspects of CHRAJ's work. Parliamentary staff also benefited from several forms of training and capacity development initiatives with some undertaking long-term courses such as MBAs.

Discussions with most beneficiaries of these capacity development initiatives and training programmes confirmed satisfaction with the training programmes though some observers were of the view some level of training fatigue was beginning to set in.

In terms of **civil society**, the impact of capacity development and institutional development of CSOs and CBOs has been tremendous, particularly CBOs supported under the IBIS programme.

Regarding **gender**, existing activity reports on training and capacity development indicate great satisfaction from all beneficiaries. The actions taken (e.g. gender trainings) usually led to improved capacity to mainstream gender in the organisations where such courses were given. This counts for example the transport and health ministries. An encouraging development is that more participants than the absorption capacity of the trainings was wished to have taken part. Needs for the training courses to be extended and expanded have been constantly articulated.

5.6 Impacts and sustainability

5.6.1 Administrative and institutional reforms and improved service delivery

This section deals with two interlinked issues at the same time, as very often the first is a prerequisite to progress on the second:

- To what extent could support contribute to progress in administrative and institutional reforms that aim at improved service delivery for the clients?
- To what extent could support contribute to improved quality of service delivery?

Overall progress in administrative and institutional reforms is at best slow in public administration in Ghana, and thus its possible contribution to improved service delivery by public administration. This generally also applies to the sectors that benefit of Danida support:

1) Health

In 1996 the GHS was established under Act 525 as an autonomous executive agency responsible for health services delivery through the public **health** system. The implementa-

tion of the reform has been plagued by a number of issues including: (i) the lack of clarity of roles and responsibilities and complementarities in some areas between MoH and GHS, (ii) the weak capacity of MoH after most senior staff left this agency to join the GHS and were replaced with less experienced staff, and (iii) the failure to review/adopt the legislative instrument to implement Act 525.

While these issues were repeatedly raised in summit (and other) meetings and documented in progress reports, they have persisted until recently. This has created some confusion and inefficiencies in health sector operations, especially at the national level. The MoH has signed MoU with the Christian Health Association of Ghana (CHAG) but has not as yet expanded its service capacity through the development of contractual arrangements with other NGOs and the private sector. Incentive packages exist to honour performing health staff during the year get-together.

In the framework of GPRS as such (and the MTHD/POW), one of its pillars/cornerstones is improved quality of **health** service. Ghanaian capacity in the health sector has been enhanced through support to organisation and management review of Primary Health Care (PHC) curriculum, as well as decentralisation of the sector. In addition, short-term and long-term technical assistants have been provided for financial management, transport, EMU, quality assurance, and further support for post-graduate training outside Ghana, particularly in Denmark. Moreover, support for development of health systems has contributed to capacity development in the sector, and thus to improvements in service delivery. As noted through reviews of programme documents and fieldwork, financial reporting on the sector has improved significantly at all levels. In addition, the capacities of districts, particularly in UWR, to plan and prepare budgets, have witnessed improvements over the years. Of the eight District Directors of health services in the UWR, for instance, only one has not benefited from a Danida-supported post-graduate programme outside the country.

A major problem is the lacking customer-oriented attitude of health workers in their provision of services. This issue is being addressed through awareness creation and educational programmes. However, client satisfaction surveys are not conducted regularly. Furthermore, high workloads due to shortages of health staff result in long waiting times for clients at facilities. The 2003 Service Provision Assessment, measuring clients' satisfaction of reproductive health services, revealed that attitudes of service providers towards clients remain a major barrier to the access to FP services.

The World Bank (2005) states: "The health sector during the review period developed a vision for service delivery and effectively built the human capacity, policies and procedures to shift service delivery to the district level. It pioneered the SWAp approach." From an overall perspective, Danida support has contributed to enhancing the capacity of the MoH and GHS to deliver better quality health services to the people.

2) Transport

An even less pleasing situation with less noticeable impact persists in the **transport** sector. Institutional change has been discussed for over a decade but only now are the draft National Transport Policy and Institutional Study of the Transport Sector nearing completion. The prospects, however, do not look very encouraging. To what extent the proposals will be accepted remains a question. Moreover - taking into account past experience of very slow progress - the pace of change is not expected to increase significantly.

Danida support to trunk road rehabilitation is a contribution to **transport** sector service delivery, not only in terms of an upgraded length of trunk road on a major corridor¹⁵, but also

¹⁵ Konongo – Kumasi is on the N_S corridor (Accra – Kumasi – Bolgatanga); Takoradi – Agona is on the East – West (E-W) coastal road.

in terms of contribution to road safety and social aspects along the road. The manner in which these issues were dealt with as an integrated whole is instructive for similar trunk road interventions.

Special attention has been given to decentralisation, with Danida support deepening from Transport Sector Programme Support (TSPS) 1 (concentrating initially on Department of Feeder Roads (DFR) decentralisation) and 'leveraging' this support in TSPS 2, to widened support to DWDs, arguably outpacing the GoG pace of decentralisation. While this support is in line with civil service policies regarding staff, the projected transfer of staff and responsibilities to LGSS will require considerable focus and support to ensure that the pace of decentralisation does not outpace the capacity and resources of LGSS to manage the change process' expansion to more than 130 districts.

Overall, there is good reason to believe that there is considerable scope for up-scaling Danida-supported decentralisation methodologies to more districts or to other regions. However, successful up-scaling can only take place at the national rate of progress, using national institutions (some of which may still require considerable support to manage their new responsibilities, e.g. LGSS). Therefore, this process is likely to be slow and a long period of support may be necessary.

3) Water and sanitation

Regarding Danida's support to the **water and sanitation** sector in Ghana at national, regional and district levels, capacity development has been a major component, and a key strategy of Danida within all the Sector Programme Support (SPS) programmes. It has involved not only the traditional training and TA, but also operational and logistical support and incentives. Sector investments have also been made to allow this capacity to develop. However, the obvious dilemma is how to balance making the resources available with sustainability over the longer term.

Stakeholder consultation, intensive community development and training programmes and an adaptive approach which encourages learning and building on experiences is an effective strategy adopted to ensure that capacity development activities remain relevant to the needs of the sector.

Overall, Danish support to capacity development in the water and sanitation sector has been comprehensively looking beyond pure training to also target institutional strengthening and systems development. Many of the sector's institutions are now able to perform their respective functions more efficiently. Subsequently, this has a positive impact on the quality of service delivery. The establishment of the Water Directorate in the Ministry of Water Resources Works and Housing (MWRWH) was partly a result of the support from Danida. The Danish support has certainly contributed to an increase in the competence of staff in the Water Resources Information System (WRIS) institutions, Water Resources Commission (WRC), Community Water and Sanitation Agency (CWSA), District Water and Sanitation Team (DWST), the EAHs and the GES. Similarly, staff in the districts are more confident in the preparation of their DWSPs, and contractors and POs are better able to deliver services to communities. However, progress in building District administration (DA) capacity remains low within many areas. This concerns particularly the capacity to update district plans, evaluate tenders, supervise construction, and monitor operation and maintenance. The immediate problem seems to be the frequent transfers of core district staff such as District Coordinating Directors, Finance Officers, Planning Officers, and Budget Officers - a problem that is symptomatic of the general capacity of the DAs.

Box 6: Successes of capacity development in the water and sanitation sector¹⁶

In 2004, Danida applied a capacity development outcome evaluation (CDOE) methodology in two Danida supported programmes in Ghana: the water sector programme and the thematic programme for good governance and human rights. The study was undertaken during the period July through September 2004 and provides a solid background for a more comprehensive institutional assessment. One conclusion of the study is that capacity development has been more successful in the water sector than in decentralisation to the local authorities. In the water sector, the study identified significant changes in the outputs and outcomes of CWSA since its establishment in 1998. The changes in outputs include:

- development of training and technical assistance support to regions and districts,
- significant increases in facilities such as household latrines.

Changes in outcomes include:

- increases in water supply and sanitation in rural communities,
- improved data collection, *and*
- improvement in relationships with NGOs.

The changes in the output of CWSA can be explained by a number of factors. The most significant of these factors are well-qualified and competent staff, continued sector investment, capacity development support from various sources, and core government funding (though delays in release affects effectiveness). According to the study, whilst Danida's support to capacity development has been significant, it did not account for all changes in output and outcomes. Inputs from other sources such as government, the World Bank and CWSA's own efforts have all contributed to the changes.¹⁷ This is positive from the point of view of institutional sustainability.

Some the capacity development outcomes resulting from Danida interventions over the years can be summarised as follows:

A. Human Resource Development

- Skills development at regional and district level, technical and managerial training and awareness interventions at the community level and involvement of the private sector.
- Continued support to Human Resources Development (HRD) programme for WRC and its Secretariat. Training of professionals and development of skills related to management functions at DA level.
- Improvement of teachers' capability. Coaching and supervision of SHEP coordinators. TNA at different levels.

B. Organisational strengthening

- Capacity development at the regional and district level.
- Equipment supplied to WRIS institutions.
- Capacity development at DA and local community level. Internal organisational development of WRC and its Secretariat.
- Support from international adviser for SHEP.
- Operationalisation of the Water Directorate at MWH and the Environmental Health Unit at MLGRD. Improved planning capacity at CWSA.

C. Systems Development

- Development of District Water and Sanitation Plans. Involvement of the communities and the private sector in O&M.
- Development of an efficient and effective management system, and decentralised water resources management structures. Continued development of Decision Support System (DSI).
- Development of curricula, teaching aids and hygiene promotion material at national level.
- Development of CWSA's monitoring and evaluation system for integration in system established by MWH and MoLGRDE in collaboration with GPRS Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) system.

¹⁶ For further details, please refer to the Thematic Paper on Water and Sanitation.

¹⁷ Ministry of Foreign Affairs / Danida: Capacity Development Output Evaluation. Step 4: Draft Evaluation Report. December 2004.

3) Private sector

In the realm of the **private sector** and the government institutions related to it, Danida has been providing capacity development for both public and private institutions, thereby supporting the development and upgrading of an enabling environment for private sector activity. In the **Financial Sector Support** for rural and community banks and their apex organisation was the precursor of the Rural Financial Services Project (RFSP) 2000-06 by donors IFAD, IDA, and AfDB and has contributed to facilitate the enhanced development of rural financial mediation. Recently, in particular the development by the **BSPS** of the CC in Accra has upgraded Ghanaian commercial conflict resolution in and around the capital to state-of-the-art standards, providing a benchmark for neighbouring states in West Africa. However, the improvements in public service delivery aimed at by the **BSPS** have progressed at a different pace: While the Danida-supported capacity development of the Commercial Court has clearly been successful, the Registrar General's Department (RGD) is progressing slowly, and both the public service reform and the access to the trade component currently lack significant momentum.

A common problem for all of these reforms, and thus for improved service delivery, is the lack of decentralisation and the bias towards reforming client services in the Accra area. Also, a major and repeated query of the MDAs is the complicated procedures of procurement that, together with the not yet established decentralised financial management stipulated in the pooled funding MoU, are delaying implementation.

For some of the reforming institutions there is a problem of revenue retention, implying that retained revenue is not sufficient for covering incurred costs. The CC is allowed to retain only 15 % of fees, but would need 40% to cover costs. The RGD is allowed to retain 20%, which is not sufficient to break even either. For both, there is thus a threat to the sustainability of reforms.

4) Decentralisation

As for **decentralisation**, Danida support has been beneficial in supporting structures and systems. For example, under DSDA, JSA consultants were based at the MoLGRDE, but provided technical assistance to the DAs. However, this support did not fundamentally touch upon administrative or institutional forms in the narrow sense and at national level. This only happened with Danida support under the GGHR, where the Decentralisation Secretariat and the MoLGRDE were directly supported. As an official at the ministry puts it "Capacity building initiatives have been very useful particularly in the design of the Functional and Organisational Assessment Tool (FOAT)". The secretariat worked as a team with the TA, and all ministry staff benefited from the various training programmes offered by Danida and other donors to the secretariat. Capacity development is therefore not limited to the secretariat alone. All directors within the ministry have been supplied with equipments to help with their work. Due to low levels of funding from government all forms of technical assistance is welcomed.

Whether Danida support has, overall, resulted in improved quality of **public services** in the field of **GGHR** is difficult to measure. However, there are reports suggesting that there has been some level of improved service delivery at a decentralised level. For example, training provided to the RPCUs resulted in increased levels of support to the DAs by way of monitoring and the development of district development plans.

At the time of this report's writing, an extension of Danida sector support for the period 2009-2013 is being prepared jointly by GoG and the Royal Danish Embassy (RDE). This will be in the form of the **Decentralised Service Delivery Programme (DSDP)**, which is conceived to provide support to decentralisation (DWDs and DAs) with a focus on district level service delivery, provision of water and sanitation, rural housing, feeder-road mainte-

nance and spot improvement (SI). This is to be achieved through capacity building of DWDs (in financial management, administration and technical issues), plus funding for road works, Non-motorised transport (NMT), water and sanitation and integrated water resource management (IWRM), housing and contributions to district development funds (DDFs). Although preparation is still incomplete, this proposed approach (which responds to GPRS II) intends to bring together previous Danida sectoral support (to water and transport) programmes, both of which have had independent sector concepts of decentralisation support covering 25 out of 138 districts nationwide in 2-3 regions (assumed to be those in which ongoing Danida support is concentrated). In terms of capacity development, this merger has a potential of creating synergies between the sectors, while at the same time focusing capacity development efforts.

5) Independent Governance Institutions and civil society

Regarding **developing capacity of organisations that aim at challenging policy changes** towards more transparency and accountability (**independent governance institutions**) and **empowering civil society**, striking examples of changes and impacts have been instigated by Danida's support for good governance and human rights. Danida has been providing support to numerous small projects, elections, the media, NGOs, decentralisation and community development (the latter mainly related to health and education). From the beginning of the 1990s, these forms of Danida support considerably helped contribute to enhancing transparency and accountability.

Another good example of the impact of such support is the Institute of Economic Affairs (IEA), a CSO having benefited from various Danida support initiatives for capacity development. For example the administrative system was computerised – moving from manual accounting to a computerised system. Staffing levels were upgraded and training programmes developed for all levels. Similarly, support to CSOs under G-RAP went mainly to institutional building and the strengthening of management systems within these organisations.

The capacity developed finally also helped IEA to host the first “shadow” Consultative Group meeting, which immediately preceded the Consultative Group (CG) meeting held in Accra in April 2002, and provided a platform for civil society input into the economic governance process, as well as debates on the need for state funding of political parties, and on the establishment of a fund for the promotion of multi-party democracy.

Another example is CHRAJ, whose service delivery seems to have improved. It is clear, however, from the increasing number of complaints CHRAJ is receiving, that more and more people are aware of its work.

Overall, a number of staff supervisors from the IGIs and the district assemblies state that some noticeable changes were registered in staff output, particularly among budget officers who received training in financial management and reporting or a certificate in business management from GIMPA. Computer skills of administrative staff were also cited as improved, as was even the behaviour of frontline staff. As one Municipal Chief Executive put it: “We didn't even know frontline staff had to be trained on how to answer telephone calls and receive visitors. These are skills we took for granted”. Some staff also confirmed they were applying what they had learnt. However, if the evidence from the database is anything to go by, then skills have not actually been internalised.

6) Gender

Danida support for capacity development in **gender** issues also concerned a broad range of stakeholders. **Danida was extremely supportive of capacity development in gender issues at all levels for staff of implementing partners as well as beneficiaries.** It is also to be emphasised that capacity development in **gender mainstreaming** has been

made possible among NGOs and MDAs only through the support of donors such as Danida, since there is no harmonised and consistent effort by the GoG to support such activities. Capacity of the supported NGOs in gender mainstreaming was enhanced with most of the organisations now having the capacity to develop and implement larger projects targeting women and the vulnerable, and covering more districts and communities. Especially worth mentioning is Danida support for building the capacity of the Ghana Police Administration and the Attorney General's Department to assist the police in handling victims and perpetrators of domestic violence¹⁸, as well as enhancement of the capacity of the MOWAC in the monitoring and evaluation of the GPRS. Undoubtedly, the capacity development project for MOWAC provides a clear example of how capacity development can enhance individual governmental and non-governmental organisations' capacity to fulfil their mandate and achieve their organisational objectives.

Overall, Danida support to MOWAC and NGOs has contributed to improving their levels of service delivery. Knowledge of accountable and efficient administrative and management procedures has supported improved levels of administrative and financial management among the Danida-funded organisations. Overall, however, owing to low staff retention levels, the benefits seemed to have been higher for individuals than for institutions.

5.6.2 Staff retention, sustainability and brain drain

Sustaining the gains from capacity enhancement was and remains a problem. It also relates to the high staff turnover of various organisations as well as to changes in the organisational structure. Bearing this in mind, the particular highlights across the sectors are as follows:

- In the MOH and GHS generally, there is evidence of a high attrition rate of **health** staff, particularly medical doctors and nurses. The majority of the health workers in Ghana leave for international jobs because of poor working conditions and low salaries, whilst others migrate to procure further accommodation and have better prospects for promotion (MOH, 2007). Internal migration of health staff also exists between the rural and urban areas and between regions, due mainly to poor working conditions in the areas of origin.

Lack of career structure within community nursing has also compelled ambitious nurses to undertake general nursing training and leave the community nursing field altogether. Though this movement is within the country, it hampers government efforts of strengthening primary health care in the country-side / rural areas.

Though there is a generally high attrition of health staff in the country, evidence from records of health staff trained with Danida support reveals that the retention rate is quite high among this category of trainees. Of the 20 health staff trained in UWR, 70% were still at post in the region and 20% had been transferred to other regions within GHS. Only 10% had been lost to the GHS due to either death or the desire to seek better opportunities (see following table).

Overall, at national level the brain drain has affected the country's capacity to improve its human resource base in order to meet its population's increasing health needs. However, the government has recognised the threat of the brain drain and has instituted incentive measures to stem the flow.

¹⁸ AWLA was able to offer training to a total of 205 police officers on the handling of Domestic Violence. It is reported to be the first of its kind in Ghana, training police officers in all ten regions with another 82 police officers trained as trainers in handling domestic violence.

- Regarding **water and sanitation**, there is a very low attrition rate among professional staff. Within CWSA, for instance, it was reported that the number of staff leaving their post after training has been less than 10% over the period of engagement with Danida, and most of those who have left are administrative staff¹⁹. The WRIS also reported that it is only in rare circumstances have professionals failed to remain at their post after completing training. It was noted, though, that in rare cases in which better paid jobs were offered by international agencies, some professionals had taken up positions with these.

On the other hand, at the district assembly level, a higher staff-turnover is recorded due to low salaries, poor conditions of service and frequent transfers. This is particularly the case among middle-level professionals, creating capacity problems within the assemblies.

- As for **transport**, MRT and road sector agencies have difficulty in retaining good quality staff as civil service conditions of employment are not competitive with those of the private sector. Only very limited new recruitment is permitted whilst retrenchment was only partially implemented and plans for another phase of retrenchment appears to have stalled. This situation is a serious constraint to institutional capacity development and the salary gap between public and private sectors is widening.

On the other hand, there are many examples of Ghanaian engineers occupying senior positions in other countries (e.g. Chief Executive of Tanroad in Tanzania, or a senior resident engineer for major road contracts in Mozambique) and in international agencies by virtue of relative advantages conferred by English language skills combined with good technical education.

- In the **GGHR** field, staff attrition is also very high. In the case of CHRAJ, many staff depart after they have been trained owing to poor salaries and conditions of service. The same situation holds for the district assemblies, where the inability to sustain payments to staff of area councils resulted in high staff turnover at that level. For many of the institutions visited, particularly the DAs, only one out of three staff members is likely to be in post a year after training.

The exception to the rule was Parliament, where quite a number of staff are still at post. For instance, the current Clerk to Parliament was a beneficiary of Danida support to undertake a Master programme in Public Administration.

- As for **gender**-related projects, issues relating to staff retention are linked to the ability of MDAs and NGOs to remunerate their staff adequately and also provide enough other motivation to remain and utilise the knowledge acquired. A problem is that once staff receive training, they often use their improved knowledge base as a step towards other financially rewarding job opportunities, mainly in the private sector. In fact, most trained staff from MDAs and NGOs have since left, the majority of the younger NGO staff pursuing further training and subsequently taking up employment opportunities outside Ghana.

So, overall, numerous staff trained were moved to other units in the organisation or to other districts in the same or other regions. This involved schedule changes which often did not necessarily require the application of the knowledge and skills received. However, at national level, institutional memory is not necessarily lost and is being channelled into other programmes, regions, or districts.

¹⁹ Interview with the Eastern Regional Director, CWSA, August 2007

5.7 Special cases of Danish support

5.7.1 Academic qualification upgrading – Denmark’s support to higher education

The bilateral Programme for Enhancement of Research Capacity in Developing Countries (ENRECA) is a partnership arrangement between Danish and host-country institutions with the purpose of promoting mutual learning through collaborative research and research capacity enhancement. The objectives of the programme are: 1) to promote research of significance for the social and economic development of the country, 2) to improve the country’s capacity to utilize results of international research and 3) to improve the quality of the training offered at institutions of higher learning. It is a demand-driven global programme and does not form part of the Country Programmes, i.e. it is managed completely outside these programmes, with the embassies usually only marginally involved in preparation and implementation.

Since 1992, Danish support to higher education under the ENRECA programme went mostly to a number of departments of the University of Legon, Ghana. According to the 1999/2000 evaluation of ENRECA²⁰, its “emphasis on long-term sustainability, taken together with the fact that its support is time-bound, implies that the aim of the programme is to create complete research capacity by the time the final phase of the project is completed”. ENRECA’s means of building capacity is through twinning arrangements, which assume that the host country institution already has some degree of research capacity and that the Danish partner will supply the missing areas of competence. This approach carries with it a number of risks, including:

- If the partner’s existing capacity is strengthened and deepened, but is not also broadened to include the areas of competence that were initially supplied by the Danish partner, then complete research capacity will not be attained.
- With the collaborative research project as the main capacity-building instrument, there is a danger that the project is viewed primarily as a means of generating a research product, while capacity development is regarded almost as a by-product.

In addition, however, some projects related to capacity development in Ghanaian research were also financed under Local Grant Authority (LGA), independently from the ENRECA programme. Most of the ENRECA-supported programmes have terminated. Currently, no research project is being financed under LGA. Together with the projects financed under LGA, an approximate total of DKK 120m has been spent on support to higher education, including support to improving remote sensing capacity, libraries, hydro-geological laboratories, construction work at the Institute for African Studies, exchange programmes, and others.²¹

Among one of the ENRECA evaluation findings was that, at that time and as an exception to the general rule, there was quite intense communication between ENRECA projects and the Embassy to the extent that a senior member of Danida staff were designated to ensure

²⁰ [Danida \(2000\): Evaluation of Danida’s Bilateral Programme for Enhancement of Research Capacity in Developing Countries \(ENRECA\). January 2000.](#)

²¹ Among the Danish partners were the Institute of Geography, University of Copenhagen, the Centre for International Studies, Aalborg University, the Geological Institute and the Institute of Geography, University of Copenhagen, Department of Dairy and Food Science, Royal Danish Veterinary and Agricultural University, Copenhagen, the Centre for Medical Parasitology (for Malaria Research), Copenhagen University Hospital, the Institute of Medical Microbiology & Immunology, Royal Danish School of Pharmacy, Copenhagen, the Centre for Tele-Information, Technical University of Denmark, Department of Human Settlements, the Royal Danish Academy of Fine Arts, Copenhagen.

smooth communication between the two sets of activities. The evaluation states that “the improvement since this has happened has been remarkable. Otherwise, SPS staff are involved in ENRECA only in administrative matters or when they are asked to comment on proposals.”

Overall, as confirmed by the present evaluation, Danish support to capacity development is highly appreciated by the institutions having benefited from ENRECA, as it has helped develop structures and human resource capacity through exchanges, researcher visits, and so on, while maintaining good and collaborative co-operation along with the necessary flexibility sometimes required, especially with regard to administrative matters. Interviewees confirm considerable increases in outputs, i.e. Master degrees and Doctorates, research papers and publications. Also, research findings are partly used outside the academic world, for example hydrological research has been used by CWSA and the Ghana Atomic Energy Commission. All this led to the building of a reputation in the concerned fields, to the extent that students from other countries are now applying to undertake research, for example in hydrogeology. It must be emphasised that all supported MSc. and Doctorate students not only found jobs after their studies, either inside or outside the University, but that these jobs also corresponded to their level of education.²²

The benefits of Danish support to higher education have been created not only on the Ghanaian side, but also on the Danish side: Danish students continue coming to Ghana for their field research.

Support to higher education has been given on a project-to-project basis – be it through ENRECA or through LGA, with some ENRECA projects extending over more than a decade. However, these projects have never been included in an overall framework of support, that is in the budget of the institutions supported, with a view to creating more ownership at the level of university management, and thus to ensuring sustainability of the investments made, continued contributions by the universities to running and maintenance costs, and so on. This means that sustainability is generally at risk, although some institutes have found ways of generating revenue (e.g. the Business School).

So, on the whole, Danida support to higher education can be assessed as relevant and effective, with considerable impact, mostly short and medium term. This confirms findings of the ENRECA evaluation that states: “Overall, the ENRECA programme seems to be an imaginative and effective example of how a relatively small amount of money may be used to build public sector research capacity in developing countries.”

5.7.2 MDBS and capacity development to implement the GPRS

The GoG had formulated its goals and medium-term policy priorities in the GPRS I document for 2003 – 2005. The cost of the medium-term priorities was set at USD 2,515m over the period 2003 – 2005. The financing of the GPRS was expected to come from the government’s own sources, HIPC savings, grants, loans, concessional loans and general budget support. Nine DPs committed themselves to supporting the GoG in implementing the GPRS within the MDBS framework. In return, the GoG was expected to finance the budgetary operation over the medium term in support of the GPRS.

²² This is in line with the findings of the ENRECA evaluation: “ENRECA has shown itself to be efficient in using its financial and other resources to mobilise the enthusiasm of researchers from both North and South, thus creating synergistic relationships. Many projects have increased returns by working in collaboration with other organisations to conduct parallel and co-ordinated work that increases the output of both sides. The flexibility and problem-orientation of ENRECA’s management is widely credited for promoting efficiency in the field. The “sandwich” approach to PhD training is both efficient and effective.”

Denmark took an active part in the design of the MDBS and decided to participate in the mechanism in order to ensure that Denmark was actively involved in the strategic discussions related to GPRS and especially to issues pertaining to governance, this being one of Denmark's major focuses and areas of expertise. The MDBS was considered as an important vehicle for a joint GoG and Development Partners (DP) policy dialogue on key issues, including funding, in relation to GPRS implementation. Participation in this core policy dialogue was considered important, as it enabled easy access to information as well as influence at the very heart of the Government's reform and poverty reduction agenda. This was not only to benefit the other components of the GGHR Programme but the whole country programme. Another factor was the poor macro-economic performance at that time, the modest quality and low efficiency of public financial management and public sector service delivery in general, including tracking of results (also compared to other Danida partner countries in Africa), and the fact that reforms within these areas were very slow. However, a major shift towards general budget support linked to the GPRS was seen as premature. Hence the decision to be an active partner in the MDBS but with a modest contributions of DKK 10m a year.

The MDBS also aims at increasing the predictability of donor flows. The Government institutions responsible for GPRS implementation and key stakeholders in the MDBS arrangement are the Central Management Agencies: Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, the Controller and Accountant General's Department, the Auditor General's Department, NDPC, and a number of key ministries, departments and agencies (MDAs).

The intermediary objective was to "Provide the budgetary basis and promote policy incentives for the successful implementation of the GPRS".

Starting 2004, Danida made bi-annual contributions to the MDBS: a fixed tranche to be released in the first half of each year, and a performance tranche to be released in the second half of each year. Disbursement of the base tranche was conditioned on the Government being on track with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility (PRGF) programme. Disbursement of the performance tranche depended on the Government's fulfilment of the triggers, to be agreed on an annual basis between the GoG and the DPs for the subsequent year.

In 2006, an appraisal mission took place to plan new Danida support to the MDBS. The mission concluded that "the strong improvements in the government's public financial management system in recent years, as well as improvements in the quality of policy dialogue between the government and development partners, means that the basis has been established for budget support to be an effective mechanism in Ghana."

The appraisal team saw Danish participation in the MDBS as complementary to other interventions. They were also of the opinion that Danish participation offered value added to the MDBS dialogue by providing knowledge about the practical results of cross-sector initiatives at both sector and local levels.

The appraisal recommended the continuation and increased levels of Danish support to the MDBS amounting to a total financial frame including reviews and studies of DKK 250m in the period 2006-2010, increasing annual amounts gradually from the recorded DKK 20m in 2005 to DKK 70m in 2010. This second phase of support to the MDBS was started at the end of 2006 and is therefore not part of this evaluation.

The MDBS encouraged the creation of the new Ministry and its Performance Assessment Framework (for the MDBS) (PAF) provisions were helpful in translating general objectives into specific actions. The scope and number of reforms since 2003 has been exceptional and the existence of the MDBS has most likely contributed to the intensity of these efforts.

However, implementation has been slow and political commitment has appeared fluctuating and partial.

According to ODI-CDD-Ghana (2007), the role for technical assistance and capacity development initiatives linked to the MDBS appears to have been limited. A formal MDBS technical assistance fund had been proposed in 2003. “However, the Government never expressed any demand for this fund and the concept was quietly dropped during 2005. There are a number of individual TA projects linked to institutional and policy initiatives captured in the MDBS PAF but these are modest in their nature and are all run on a bilateral basis between GoG and the respective funding agencies. ... There has been little formal attention paid by the GoG to using technical assistance and capacity building in a concerted manner to address the institutional and policy challenges identified in the MDBS process. This seems largely the result of a deep-seated dissatisfaction with the way in which technical assistance projects have worked in the past.”

It is widely acknowledged that the MDBS helps build the capacity of government to plan and co-ordinate, thereby increasingly setting and leading the agenda for MDBS reviews and discussions. “While the donors play a key role in the preparations and assessments, the government’s team has considerably strengthened co-ordination amongst ministries and exerted their leadership. ... The general sense is that the MDBS programme and its associated reviews, policy matrices and policy dialogue provide an opportunity for government officials to sharpen prioritisation, the management of the GPRS and cross-sectoral collaboration.” (Walters 2005) According to Walters (2005), the MDBS helps develop capacity to implement the GPRS in two important ways:

1. “Providing space for the budget to finance capacity development.
2. Concentrating attention, through dialogue and monitoring, on key crosscutting reforms to address bottlenecks to GPRS implementation. This is providing incentives and improving the efficiency of government’s reform effort.”

The MDBS performance assessment framework (PAF) that underpins monitoring and disbursement decisions includes a range of capacity development policy actions (such as “Establish the capacity in each Ministry to carry out procurement and internal audit functions consistent with the new acts”, or “Build capacity in local government by implementing the National Decentralisation Action Plan”). Actions in the PAF are derived from the GPRS and government sector plans and serve to focus attention on areas that require inter-departmental action. Policy actions are a mixture of disbursement triggers and targets.

Overall, MDBS (and thus also Danida’s contribution) has supported capacity development by providing additional budget resources to fund such investments and by using dialogue and monitoring to focus attention on cross-cutting reforms to tackle key issues. “There has been positive progress in the areas of public financial management, planning, GPRS M&E and health and education sector management, while progress has been more difficult in the areas of civil service reform and decentralisation. The dual elements of budget resources and dialogue provided by MDBS cannot entirely explain the variable pace of capacity development. Capacity development depends on a combination of political will, institutional incentives and complementary donor support. Political difficulties, particularly in the lead up to elections may explain the faltering progress on civil service reform” (Walters 2005). This indicates the complex relationship between MDBS capacity development and complementary TA support. However, according to Walters (2005), “emerging experience indicates that small-scale and co-ordinated TA can provide technical direction when senior officials drive the reforms and MDBS provides the incentives, resources and focus.”

5.8 The role of technical assistance

Technical assistance can be provided either through financial assistance to the partner country or through tied assistance from Denmark. The choice depends on agreement with the recipient, based on a needs assessment and the availability of technical expertise and procurement capacity. In Ghana, there is now relatively little tied Danish Technical Assistance (TA), and it is declining still further, while co-ordination with other donors has increased. However, there is still room for improvement, especially regarding tied technical support in the **Business to Business Programme** (B2B), relying by definition on partnership with Danish enterprises, and (albeit reportedly temporary) on a project implementation unit for private sector development (OECD/DAC 2007).

TAs have been used by Danida in all major programmes. It's worth noting that at the end of the 1990s, support to DSDA was the first substantial contract awarded to a local consultancy company.

Whether explicit or implicit, and varying according to sector, Danida's implementation strategy seems to have been along the following lines: While focus on the project level was still high in the 1990s, external TAs (line function) had local co-managers; later in the 1990s, Ghanaian institutions seemed to increasingly become lead players (e.g. CWSA for the water sector) and the role of TA shifted towards advisory functions. Today, despite the fact that Danish TA still provides permanent support, short-term support seems to have a more prominent role to play.

Generally, the **quality of TA and its effectiveness and impact** has been rather positive across the sectors:

- In the **transport** sector, Danida technical assistance has comprised institutional support (e.g. National Road Safety Commission (NRSC), emission control, Transport Indicators Database), quasi PIU (e.g. TSPS feeder roads components), consultancy services (e.g. design and supervision services for trunk road rehabilitation) and line function (e.g. support to DFR or DWDs). Given the large sums spent on technical assistance, value for money may have been gained in executing line functions but not in terms of residual capacity, and many major technical assistance projects have little to show after the departure of the usually well-resourced FTA. Arguments that this is because the FTA acted as a PIU outside the beneficiary institution have some resonance but there are also examples of line function capability not being sustained.

While Danida support to capacity development on DFR, road safety, environmental and monitoring issues has had good immediate impact, it remains to be seen how robust this capacity is in terms of longer-term residual capacity and continuation of line function. There have also been problems with some aspects of consultancy services that were eventually resolved (in some cases by the departure of consultancy personnel), Danida's flexibility was an important factor in ensuring a satisfactory outcome. Overall, and considering the huge technical assistance support given to this sector over more than a decade, the impacts of such support appear modest.

- With regard to **health**, numerous short and long-term TAs have been provided. The long-term TAs (posted to the EMU and Transport in UWR), short-term TAs (e.g. in financial management), and the numerous in-country training workshops and on-the-job training courses have collectively contributed, along with support from the HSSO, to building capacities in the sector to manage Danida assistance efficiently.

The Health Sector Support Office (HSSO) was established as a PIU to provide effective coordinated support for the implementation of HSPS. The office has had long-term TA from Denmark and a permanent health advisor. Long-term TAs have

been recruited to help address some of the most pressing needs, within fields with particularly low capacity and only insufficiently covered by other DPs' support. In recent years, the role of HSSO has been reduced to technical support, whilst the Embassy took charge of financial disbursements as well as the overseeing of EMU and HIV/AIDS support. Interviews with both government officials and donors confirmed Danida's technical strength in the health sector and attributed this in part to the HSSO. MOH, CHAG and donor partners regularly use the HSSO's services and they acknowledge the technical competence of the office.

- TA has been a common support feature in the **water and sanitation** sector. Numerous TAs have been provided to the CWSA as well as to the other supported institutions over the period of this evaluation, ranging from management advisors to specialists such as hydrologists and engineers. In recent years, TA has focused more on short-term advisors than the original long-term TAs. There is a general appreciation of the technical input of the various TAs among the beneficiary institutions interviewed. Nonetheless, there was often concern about the proportion of budget allocation taken up by these TAs.
- As regards the **private sector**, TA figured prominently in support of the financial sector, with reportedly beneficial results, while the TA input into the BSPS has been less. However, a good example of the role TA can play is the initial implementation of **BSPS**, which put considerable effort into trying to make interventions at different levels mutually supportive through proper sequencing. Starting with policy dialogue and offering TA in preparation and support for capacity development, such sequencing contributed to the clarification of objectives as well as the feasibility of interventions and intended to clarify from the very beginning the organisational position and competence of the TA.

The World Bank (2005) broaches the issues of capacity development in the framework of SWAps: "A sector-wide approach may be more effective than traditional investment lending in helping to build capacity at the institutional level. The focus of SWAps is primarily at the policy and programme level. Multiple donors addressing systemic issues together with the sector management can facilitate consideration of policy changes and institutional reforms in a more collaborative fashion than is typically possible through an individual investment project by a single donor involving some form of conditionality. But, there appears to be an inherent problem of building human resource capacity through sector wide or budget support. Traditionally, a great deal of effective capacity building was done informally by experienced Bank task managers working closely with technical counterparts over an extended period of time on specific issues. The sector wide or programmatic approach diminishes these opportunities, for several reasons. First, the whole dialogue shifts from the technical level to the policy level. Second, there is less project supervision of specific investment activities. This suggests the need for accompanying TA projects or other mechanisms to ensure continued involvement at the operational level." This perception is confirmed by Walters (2005) who concludes that the MDBS "has supported capacity development by providing additional budget resources to fund such investments, and by using dialogue and monitoring to concentrate attention on crosscutting reforms to tackle bottlenecks. ... While the relationship between MDBS capacity development and complementary TA support is complex, emerging experience indicates that small-scale and coordinated TA can provide technical direction when senior officials drive the reforms and MDBS provides the incentives, resources and focus". In fact, this means that there remains a need for highly qualified TA to support change and reform processes also at the sectoral level.

6 Summary assessment, related to DAC criteria

Table 1: Summary of DAC-criteria assessment regarding capacity development across sectors

Criterion	Assessment
Relevance	<p>Danida capacity development support has been relevant to highly relevant, with some difference between the sectors. A general lack of both broad capacity development concepts for the sectors supported and usually missing training needs assessments²³ are likely to have reduced possible higher scores for relevance.</p> <p>Usually, measures met the immediate needs of the targeted groups and were, in most cases, also relevant to the broad sectoral capacity development needs (that are not always clearly defined).</p> <p>Checks or monitoring of application of what was learnt seem to rarely form a constituting element of the overall capacity development approach.</p>
Effectiveness and efficiency	<p>Results of Danida support to capacity development in terms of effectiveness are rather mixed. While there are excellent examples of how capacity development can be effective in the water and sanitation sector, with institutions newly created or with considerably enhanced performance due to Danida support, or also in relation to the issue of gender and gender mainstreaming, examples of rather disappointing results are more frequent. This is mainly due to the fact that, while Danida support can help address urgent needs regarding policy, organisational and institutional changes in the sectors (as it did in most cases), progress must necessarily remain stalled if GoG does not, or only slowly, progress with the required and announced policies and changes in institutional frameworks. This is especially the case for the transport sector.</p> <p>It must be noted that, in many cases, capacity development issues were present in the policy dialogue. It is unclear, however, to what extent they were always <i>considered</i> by Danida. There are examples where a presence of capacity development topics seems to be rather a “by-product” of broader dialogue.</p> <p>Satisfaction of trainees, particularly those supported by Danida, is generally good regarding the technical contents of courses. It is lower, however, as regards possibilities to apply the newly-acquired knowledge. Movement of trained staff away from the position for which they were trained is common and frustrates institutional capacity-building efforts. There is no clear career structure for technical and non-technical staff in sector institutions. Nor is there, usually, a consistent strategy on training or capacity development. Participation in training courses, especially courses abroad, is often not based on needs assessment and training but is used as an incentive.</p> <p>Whether explicit or implicit, and varyingly depending on sector, Danida’s implementation strategy seems to have been along the following lines: While focus on project level was still high in the 1990s, external TAs (line function) had local co-managers; later in the 1990s, Ghanaian institutions seem to have increasingly become lead players (e.g. CWSA for the water sector, or MOH), the role of TA shifted towards advisory functions, while nowadays, despite the fact that Danish TAs are still providing permanent support, short-term support seems to have a more prominent role to play. Generally, the quality of TA and their effectiveness and impact has been rather positive across the sectors. However, there have also been problems with some aspects of consultancy services, mostly in the transport sector, where, overall, considering the huge technical assistance support given to this sector over more than a decade, the impacts of such support appear modest.</p> <p>But generally, the role of TA remains still of considerable importance in the current context where focus on supporting organisational and institutional and policy changes is becoming more and more prominent.</p> <p>Overall efficiency of capacity development measures is difficult to judge as no figures are available (e.g. ratio cost/student, or even the budgets for capacity development in the various sectors). Only for some sectors, especially support to gender, does the evaluation conclude that capacity enhancement was efficiently designed and carried out. Here, the resources provided for the programmes were adequately applied in most instances and therefore the ex-</p>

²³ Also other donors suffer from such a lack of needs assessments, see e.g. World Bank /IEG (2008) Using Training to Build Capacity for Development. An Evaluation of the World Bank’s Project-Based and WBI Training, p. xv.

Criterion	Assessment
	pected deliverables were achieved. Likewise, most of the capacity enhancement for NGOs was coordinated to ensure that only those who required the training benefited.
Impact and sustainability	<p>Sustainability of capacity development is a perennial issue. It is directly related to the level of resources made available as well as to the institutional framework within which a function is carried out. Policies, strategies, appropriate institutional framework and resources must all be available to permit adequate functionality. Looking at capacity development in terms of institutional or organisational development, the most striking examples can be found in the water and sanitation and health sector, as well as at the level of Danida support to commercial conflict resolution and gender projects, including that of the then newly established Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs. However, across the sectors supported there continue to be serious deficiencies in some or all of these pre-requisites such that whatever modality of capacity development is attempted, results must remain limited and possibly transient.</p> <p>Service delivery overall seems to have improved in the Danida-supported sectors, especially in the water and sanitation sector, and in the health sector, where it has impacted positively on capacity and has resulted in the sector's enhanced performance. This is reflected in increased utilisation of health services and improvement in some key health outcomes. On the other hand, impact regarding service delivery seems to be lower in the transport sector. Nevertheless, by and large, Danida support contributed to improved levels of administrative and financial management among the beneficiary organisations. This must be seen in conjunction with considerable efforts usually allocated to instigate or support organisational changes in the institutions supported.</p> <p>Danida support to civil society, IGIs and private sector has helped improve their levels of service delivery, respectively, for IGIs, their capacity to influence policy changes and empower civil society, e.g. regarding gender, where support was very prominent in improving government performance related to gender (MOWAC) and in building advocacy capacity of business associations. It has also achieved laudable results in other fields of good governance, e.g. under the support to Ibis where community level groups and locally based NGOs are receiving capacity development in the promotion of good governance including issues relating to the promotion of basic civic and women's rights.</p> <p>Sustaining the gains from capacity enhancement was and remains a problem. It also relates to the high staff turnover in the various organisations, as well as to transfers and changes in organisational structure. Attrition rates are generally considerable, especially in the health sector, but also related to organisations dealing with GGHR or gender. Overall, numerous staff trained were later moved to other units in the organisation or to other districts in the same or other regions, involving schedule changes which often did not necessarily require the application of the knowledge and skills received. However, at national level institutional memory is not necessarily lost (except for health and partly also for transport with examples of engineers working abroad) and is being channelled into other programmes, regions, or districts.</p>
Other issues	<p>Water and sanitation and health sectors are those that show the most systematic incorporation of capacity development into all components of the different programme interventions. Generally, donor co-ordination regarding capacity development measures at individual level seems to be at its embryonic state. There is room for improvement, but this will also require a stronger GoG vision to clearly guide capacity development in the sectors.</p> <p>Consideration of gender and HIV/AIDs in capacity development measures is mixed. While in water and sanitation, and in the health sector, the issues seem to have been incorporated into different modules that have been developed and delivered at all levels of training, this seems not systematically the case for all measures implemented under the GGHR programme.</p>
Global Assessment	<p>Danida capacity development measures have taken numerous forms – training, short and long courses, TA, etc. It is positive that, despite a lack of clear policy frameworks regarding capacity development across basically all sectors, Danida's efforts had considerable, although varying impact. However, the sustainability of its impacts is in doubt. Danida support helped building sectoral capacities, but could, understandably, not fully overcome unfavourable framework conditions (although its support certainly helped address such issues in numerous cases).</p> <p>The fact that now, a Danida guideline exists on approaching capacity development should help structure its approach in a way that allows focussing on the most relevant and priority issues of organisational change and capacity development.</p>

7 Overall conclusions and recommendations

Table 2: Summary of overall conclusions and recommendations

	Conclusions	Recommendations
1.	<p>In most cases, Danida’s capacity development measures have been judged relevant and often effective²⁴, with partially high impact, though questions regarding sustainability remain. However, the “critical deficiencies are institutional, and some of the major problems are beyond the direct control of sector institutions to resolve. They include poor pay and conditions of service for public servants, reluctance to decentralise authority and decision-making to District and local levels, and chronic underfunding. The inability to deal with the inadequate public service pay and rewards is the single-most important failure of the past decade and remains the single largest challenge to capacity building today.” This conclusion by the World Bank (2005) is equally valid for Danida support to capacity development.</p> <p>There is, therefore, a need to constantly tackle and possibly prioritise progress or reform in the institutional frameworks in which capacity development should be embedded, i.e. supporting the setting of framework conditions for capacity development within institutions. There is also a need to think in longer time horizons when tackling capacity development in each sector, especially in the field of GGHR.</p>	<p>GoG is required to address capacity development more comprehensively in its sector policies, in the institutional framework it sets for the sectors and in the conditions of service for public servants.</p> <p>Danida should undertake further efforts to bring and/or keep capacity development on the agenda of donor groups and in dialogue with the government. It might try marketing its capacity development approach to the donor community and to GoG.</p> <p>Danida should further apply its capacity development methodology in support of the ongoing preparatory exercises for the next Country Programme.</p>
2.	<p>“Ghana does not lack talented people. There are well-trained, motivated individuals in every sector and capable staff in the central, district, and local levels. The critical problem is the ‘system’ that causes talented people to leave the country or perform below their capability”, (WB 2005) or they are shifted around in the country. All this contributes to reducing development impacts at the local levels.</p>	<p>GoG should rethink its staffing policies and rotational systems, while at the same time devising incentives for performance. Danida might support government in this regard.</p> <p>GoG (with donor support) needs to be more insistent that the resources and benefits of capacity development programmes are fielded and experienced outside the capital region. This should include directing resources to service delivery sites in areas of high poverty.</p>

²⁴ As WB 2005 puts it: “It is possible to create oases of effectiveness in a sea of inefficiency. Organizations like the Department of Urban Roads (DUR) can be highly effective even in an inauspicious environment. The key factors are leadership, an environment of integrity, recruitment and retention of young (and idealistic) staff and rewards that are as much psychic as financial. It also helps to be small. The DUR has 800 employees, compared to 3000 in the GHA, 240,000 in education and 800,000 in the civil service as a whole.”

	Conclusions	Recommendations
3.	The 2003 review (MFA, 2003a) found that long-term international technical assistance featured as the most common input to capacity development in public sector support interventions, along with training courses and workshops, and the provision of transport and office equipment. Analysis shows that TA forms an important part of support and should remain an essential element in Danida support to capacity development. The more Danida support moves away from project-based support with permanent TA, small-scale and co-ordinated TA should become the preferred option, thus replying to OECD/DAC 2007, who states that “co-ordination with other donors on TA has increased, but there is still room for improvement”.	In a context where aid increasingly moves away from project-based approaches, Danida should further move towards joint interventions involving joint TA arrangements, wherever possible. This would also help broadening the TA resource base available, especially as increasingly specialised advice will be required. ²⁵
4.	According to the World Bank (2005) the “national decentralization policy and supporting programs has made enough progress in establishing policies and basic organisational structures to allow decentralized bodies to act as a key entry point for strengthening accountability to stakeholders and beneficiaries. There is an opportunity for the GoG and donors to make accountability and civil society engagement a feature of the capacity development strategy accompanying the national policy of decentralization.” As for Danida’s envisaged support to the District Works Department (DWD), merging support to transport and water and sanitation, there is evidence that this will require considerable capacity development efforts, both at the district levels and at the central level, e.g. at the MoLGRDE and at LGSS.	GoG with support from DPs should move quickly to implement the NDAP. This can be achieved by engaging civil society organisations extensively in implementing programmes at the district level in order to promote effective decentralisation. GoG needs to clearly define its requirements in terms of support to operationalising decentralisation, especially in the context of DWD and LGSS. Danida should co-ordinate its approach and support closely with both GoG and other donors, as, after years of testing and different ways of doing things, there is a need to move much faster along the path to more decentralisation.
5.	Danida support to capacity development of civil society and IGIs requires sustaining over a rather long time span, thus developing a critical mass to better challenge accountability and transparency at all levels, and to participate in policy decision making. Without adequate organisational and institutional capacity in good governance	Danida should aim at further strengthening the co-ordination of efforts among donors supporting IGIs and thus also of capacity development efforts between IGIs. This could for instance be done through the G-RAP mechanism and Ibis since these are already established modes of working with CSOs. Support to civil society, must be continued over a longer time period of about 5 – 10

²⁵ According to ECDPM 2007, in this context TA pooling is gaining popularity as a mechanism for managing TA Personnel, offering “a number of potential benefits for increasing country participation, including: (i) aligning development-agency support around national processes; (ii) providing a framework to discuss and explore capacity needs, consider appropriateness of deploying TA personnel and encourage greater financial transparency; (iii) helping country partners to think more strategically about TA personnel and to link up with strategic and operational plans at the national, sector and sub-sector level; (iv) offering a framework to address the Paris Declaration and to reflect on the meaning and implications of indicator 4; (v) providing an opportunity to move away from the use of parallel PIUs, the concern of indicator 6, by encouraging programme-based approaches and working through national structures. But pooling is not without its risks, and there are no guarantees that its potential benefits can be fully realised in all countries. Its effectiveness depends partly on the process being country driven as part and parcel of efforts to facilitate country leadership of the development agenda.”

	Conclusions	Recommendations
	and human rights, implementing institutions will not be able to achieve the intended objectives	years in order to lay some solid foundation. Danida must ensure that all project documents include strategies for civil society capacity development which must be linked to key project activities such as support to decentralisation and the IGIs. Danida should in the private sector aim at strengthening membership based organisations, being sustainable through their commercially viable services offered to members.
6.	Capacity development regarding gender and gender mainstreaming needs further efforts in order for mechanisms to be internalised. Knowledge and skills in gender analysis are a prerequisite for effective and efficient gender mainstreaming. Integration of gender considerations into programme implementation is critical for the promotion of equality and programme sustainability. Gender analysis ensures that critical information is gender-disaggregated and processed to reveal and address gender equity gaps. This is in line with, for example, OECD (1998) DAC Guidelines for Gender Equality. Capacity to undertake gender analysis and monitoring of sector programmes throughout the implementation phases remains a major challenge, especially among programme partners.	Danida should support capacity enhancement in gender mainstreaming in this regard, ensuring that skills in gender analysis and gender mainstreaming are consistently pursued. GoG should demonstrate commitment to gender equity by providing the required financial and human resources for national gender policies, strategies and action plans to be implemented. Draft gender sector-specific policies and strategies should also be finalized and implemented. GoG should support all efforts at building the capacity of decentralised structures through the local government service to promote gender equality.

8 Annexes

8.1 Interview guidelines

As presented in the Inception Report, the following two Evaluation Questions have been used by all team members. Detailed sectoral answers to the question are provided in each Thematic Paper. Moreover, each team member has derived his/her own set of questions from the two sets of general questions presented thereafter.

8.1.1 Evaluation question on capacity development, level 1

How has the capacity of organisations and authorities to deliver appropriate services developed during the period of investigation, and what role did the international donor community play in this context?

<i>Heading levels 1 and 2</i>	Context and framework conditions Contribution of the combined development partner efforts
<i>Aspect</i>	Overall organisational capacity context and development
<i>Evaluation question</i>	How has the capacity of organisations and authorities to deliver appropriate services developed during the period of investigation, and what role did the international donor community play in this context?
<i>Sub-questions / scope of the question</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This question seeks first requires a short overview of major organisations and authorities in the country relevant for "development", and for delivering services to the population. We suggest focussing on the major organisations at general level, and those sectoral organisations that are relevant for Danida support (MOH, Ministry of Transport (MOT)...). 2. The question will require analysis of the institutional frameworks in which these organisations are operating, and if and how it rather facilitates or hinders appropriate service provision. Given the importance of the decentralisation process, we suggest a further focus to be put on this aspect.
<i>Judgement criteria</i>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> A. Positive trends in service delivery and client satisfaction B. Type and quality of observed changes in organisational performance and service delivery C. Type and quality of contributions by donor community to enhancing organisational capacity
<i>Types of analysis to be applied</i>	Change analysis, contribution analysis
<i>DAC criteria and questions related</i>	Impact, effectiveness, sustainability

Indicators	Data collection tools	Sources	Groups/ persons to inquire	Questions to ask to which group		
				Staff of DPs	Gvt. Representatives, sectoral ministries	CSOs, civil society
A	Scorings/assessments of service delivery	Document reviews	Service delivery tracking studies, reports from the local governments, reviews of individual organisations and institutions, client's surveys, etc. If possible, studies of the development of employment conditions and salaries of public and private employees			
B	1. Appreciation, by DPs, of changes in capacity of organisations regarding service delivery, general and sector-specific	Interviews with donors	DPs	Staff of DPs	What changes are you aware of in terms of improvement of local capacity due to Danida support? How do you see them in comparison to your organisation's efforts? Could you identify any way of doing capacity support that has more	

Indicators	Data collection tools	Sources	Groups/ persons to inquire	Questions to ask to which group		
				Staff of DPs	Gvt. Representatives, sectoral ministries	CSOs, civil society
				<p>prospects than other ways, e.g. TA versus long-term training abroad?</p> <p>What are the major changes in service delivery in your sector in Ghana during the past years?</p> <p>In your perception, which of them are at least partly due to Danida support?</p> <p>What do you think about Danida's overall contribution to organisational changes, improvement of performance of institutions and service delivery?</p>		
C	1. Appreciation, by Ghanaian Government, civil society and other partners of the contribution of the donor community to general changes in capacity of organisations regarding service delivery	Focus group, individual interviews	Government representatives, sectoral ministries CSOs, civil society		<p>What are the major changes that occurred during the past 15 years regarding performance of institutions that are in charge of service delivery to the population?</p> <p>What observations do you have regarding the role and contribution of all donors to such changes?</p>	<p>What are the major changes that occurred during the past 15 years regarding performance of institutions that are in charge of service delivery to the population?</p> <p>What observations do you have regarding the role and contribution of all donors to such changes?</p>
	2. Appreciation, by Ghanaian Government, civil society				How would you describe the policy dialogue between the Government and Danida, at	How would you describe the policy dialogue between the Government and Danida, at the level

<i>Indicators</i>	<i>Data collection tools</i>	<i>Sources</i>	<i>Groups/ persons to inquire</i>	<i>Questions to ask to which group</i>		
				<i>Staff of DPs</i>	<i>Gvt. Representatives, sectoral ministries</i>	<i>CSOs, civil society</i>
and other partners of impact of policy dialogue on changes induced in capacity of organisations regarding service delivery and regarding the institutional framework					<p>the level you are/were?</p> <p>How did Danida support contribute to sector policies and strategies (formulation, monitoring)?</p> <p>How prominently did the issue of capacity development figure on your agendas?</p> <p>What observations do you have regarding the role and contribution of Danida to changes related to capacity of organisations regarding service delivery and the institutional framework?</p>	<p>you are/were?</p> <p>How did Danida support contribute to sector policies and strategies (formulation, monitoring)?</p> <p>How prominently did the issue of capacity development figure on your agendas?</p> <p>What observations do you have regarding the role and contribution of Danida to changes related to capacity of organisations regarding service delivery and the institutional framework?</p>

8.1.2 Interview questions for capacity development, level 1

How has the capacity of organisations and authorities to deliver appropriate services developed during the period of investigation, and what role did the international donor community play in this context?

Target group: Gvt. Representatives, secotral ministries

Tools: Interviews and focus groups

Interviewer:	Interviewee:		
Date:	Name:	Institution:	Function:
Indicator 1. Appreciation, by Ghanaian Government, civil society and other partners of the contribution of the donor community to general changes in capacity of organisations regarding service delivery			
Questions:			Answers
What are the major changes that occurred during the past 15 years regarding performance of institutions that are in charge of service delivery to the population?			
What observations do you have regarding the role and contribution of all donors to such changes?			
Indicator 2. Appreciation, by Ghanaian Government, civil society and other partners of impact of policy dialogue on changes induced in capacity of organisations regarding service delivery and regarding the institutional framework			
How would you describe the policy dialogue between the Government and Danida, at the level you are/were?			
How did Danida support contribute to sector policies and strategies (formulation, monitoring)?			
How prominently did the issue of capacity development figure on your agendas?			
What observations do you have regarding the role and contribution of Danida to changes related to capacity of organisations regarding service delivery and the institutional framework?			

8.1.3 Evaluation question on capacity development, level 3

To what extent has Danish assistance contributed to the development of organisational and institutional capacity and sustained improved performance of these in Ghana?

Heading level 3	Concrete results of Danish financed assistance (<i>what has been the value-added to Ghana's development by Danish assistance?</i>)
Aspect	Contribution of Danish financed activities to organisational capacity achievements
Evaluation question	To what extent has Danish assistance contributed to the development of organisational and institutional capacity and sustained improved performance of these in Ghana?
Sub-questions / scope of the question	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1 In order to reach the country's strategic goals, capacity development is of utmost importance. Danida put a considerable emphasis on this aspect, which is often a pre-requisite for development. 2 Capacity development is relevant across all sectors of Danida support, an ingredient that often serves as a vehicle for broader change. Besides looking into the broader framework of capacity development, this evaluation will deal with capacity development also at the sectoral level. Here we consider it as an element that is relevant for all sectors supported. Therefore, this question is kind of cross-cutting, as we will apply it to all sectors of support. To note that the scope and the use of criteria and indicators will slightly have to vary from one sector to another, due to their different nature. Also to mention that the question dealing with aid modalities also deals with capacity issues, thus complementing this Evaluation Question (EQ). 3 The issue of major similarities/differences between Danish assistance and international assistance in general will also be dealt with when answering the question.
Judgement criteria	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> A. Consideration, by Danida, of capacity development issues in policy dialogue, general and in individual sectors B. Relative (strategic) importance given to capacity development measures in individual programmes and sectors C. Satisfaction of trainees of all kinds with the capacity development measures D. Relevance of capacity development measures to in-country needs E. Level of retention of staff trained F. Progress in administrative and institutional reforms that aim at improved service delivery for the clients G. Improved quality of service delivery
Comments on criteria	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> B The strategy 2004 to 2008 emphasises that "Denmark will seek to promote capacity development in the relevant institutions, most importantly the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, and the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development through the Thematic Programme for Good Governance and Human Rights." The latter thematic programme will therefore have to be checked regarding such measures, as it was strategically chosen.
Types of analysis to be applied	<i>Change analysis and contribution analysis</i>
DAC criteria and questions related	Effectiveness, relevance (from user satisfaction), sustainability

Criterion	Indicators	Data collection tools	Sources	Groups/ persons to inquire
A	1. Evidence and frequency of treatment of capacity development issues in policy dialogue	1. Analysis of recurrent issues relating to capacity development in government-Danida discussions; Focus group	Focus group notes; analysis of high level discussion documents	Focus group at ministerial and sectoral level
	2. Incidences of dialogue issues taken up in general or sectoral policies and priorities	2. Document analysis, interviews	Minutes of High level consultation group meetings, interview notes	DPs, Danida staff, government staff
B	1. Budget share of capacity development measures, including training	1. Programme documents, financial data	Danida files, government budgets	
	2. Existence of training needs assessment	2. Analysis of training needs assessment	Document	
	3. Ratio on-the-spot-training/in-country education and training/out-country education and training/organisational change cost or measures	3. Analysis of programme documents, interviews with human resource managers in programmes	Programme documents, interviews	Human resource managers in programmes
	4. Appropriateness of timing and duration of measures	4. Analysis of programme documents, interviews with human resource managers in programmes, and trainees	Programme documents, interviews	Human resource managers in programmes, and trainees
	5. Existence of organisational analysis as a basis for capacity development	5. Document analysis	Document on organisational analysis	
	6. Extent to which conclusions and recommendations from organisational analyses have been considered	6. Interviews with management staff of programmes; other staff, ministries	Interview notes	Management staff of programmes; other staff, ministries, Danida staff
C	1. % of trainees satisfied with the quality of capacity development measures at the end of a course	1. User survey of trainees, at the end of term	Existing surveys (Availability?)	
	2. % of trainees confirming that they applied what they learnt at least to a good degree	2. User survey of trainees, at earliest 1 year after term If not available: Individual interviews of former trainees, to get trends	Existing surveys (Availability?)	Former trainees
D	Coherence of measures with policies and strategies in place at the time when the measures took place	1. Comparison curricula with relevant policies and strategies	Analysis	
E	% of staff in post for which they have been trained 1 year after the course	Interviews	Ministries, districts, TAs, etc.	Staff of ministries concerned, districts, TAs etc.
F	1. Existence of job descriptions	1. Documents analysis	Ministries, districts, etc.	
	2. Existence of incentives for performance	2. - 4. Documents analysis, interviews	Ministries, districts, TAs, etc.	Staff of ministries concerned, districts, TAs etc.
	3. Level in decentralisation of decision-making, responsibilities and budget authority towards the most appropriate level	3. - 4. Focus group, interviews	Interview notes	District staff, staff of ministries concerned, districts, TAs etc.
	4. Existence and operation of decentralised revenue raising mechanisms			
G	1. Rapidity of client servicing	1. - 2. Document analysis, interviews	Evaluations, client satisfaction surveys	Staff of ministries concerned, districts, TAs etc.
	2. Client satisfaction with services provided			

8.2 Focus group discussion with representatives of Danish support to the University of Ghana

Added value of Denmark's assistance to Ghana over the last 16 years with University officials

In the framework of the evaluation of
Ghana-Denmark Development Cooperation from 1990 to 2006

8.2.1 Target group

University officials, i.e. beneficiaries of support, comprising (former) managers of Danida support:

- A.A. Alemna –University Librarian, Balme Library
- A.Q.Q. Aboagye – Centre for International Business at the Business School (UGBS)
- Bruce Banoeng-Yakubo – Dept. of Geology, Enreca Project for Hydro-zoology at the Dept of Zoology
- Paul W.K. Yankson – Dept of Geography, Enreca Project for Remote Sensing
- Augustine Andoh – Assistant Registrar, Office of the Vice Chancellor
- E. Amamoo-Okyere – Head of the Centre for Remote Sensing Unit (CERSGIS)
- Seth K A Danso – Ecological Laboratory

And covering the following support:

- 104.DAN.5-8 The IFLA/Danida Project “Interlibrary Lending and Document Delivery in Developing Countries”. A trial project
- APPLICATION OF REMOTE SENSING AND DIGITAL IMAGE PROCESSING FOR ENVIRONMENTAL MONITORING, EDUCATION AND RESEARCH (Danida/Enreca) 1992-2005
- LABORATORY FOR DETERMINATION OF NUTRIENT CIRCULATION: 'ECOLOGICAL LABORATORY"
- Enhancement at Research and Teaching Capacity in Hydrogeology and Hydrology at the University of Ghana (Phase 2).
- International Business Research and Educational Cooperation between Aalborg University (Centre for International Studies, CIS) and University of Ghana (School of Administration, SoA)
- Establishment of a Research and Education Network in Ghana – 104.Ghana.12-147

The Director of the Institute of African Studies, Takyiwaa Manuh, that had benefited from Danida’s “Institutional support to the Institute of African Studies”, was not present, but met after the meeting.

Overall, the support amounted to some DKK 120m, i.e. roughly USD 22m.

8.2.2 Main research question

In your opinion, what has been the added value of Denmark's assistance to ULG over the last years?

8.2.3 Major questions

1. What comes in your mind when you think of Danish support in general to ULG?
2. What is your feeling about how well Danida's support fitted into University strategy? How well did it fit into the country's higher education policy?
3. Can you recall how the choice of your departments as beneficiaries was made?
4. Overall, during preparation and implementation of your projects, how would you describe the dialogue between you and Danida, at the level you are/were?
5. How was management organised between you and your partner organisation, and the Embassy? What worked well, what could have been working better?
6. Let us talk about capacity building: What kinds of capacity building did you benefit from?
7. What contribution did Danida support make to overall capacity building at your departments?
8. What has remained out of that? Is staff still in place? What about trained staff /students – did they find jobs? Can they apply their knowledge there?
9. What about equipments and structures?
10. What about research outputs? Are there any changes as a consequence of support?
11. What about exchange? And research collaboration?
12. What about sustainability of benefits? Do you still feel the benefits of the support? Anything missing to ensure sustainability?
13. Is there a sequencing of types of support that you would recommend to be followed, and why?
14. Are there examples of innovations or newly developed concepts that have been spread from Danida to other sectors, universities, etc.?
15. I guess there has been other support by other countries to the university. If we would compare Danish support to other donors, what strikes you most?
 - Way of doing things
 - Impact
 - Impact on improvement of performance of institutions/capacity of organisations

8.3 Persons met

The following list only comprises people that have been discussed with on Danida support to higher education; all other people interviewed regarding capacity development are shown in the other Thematic Papers.

<i>Name, first name</i>	<i>Organisation / institution, function</i>
Alemna, A.A.	University Librarian, Balme Library
Aboagye, A.Q.Q.	Centre for International Business at the Business School (UGBS)
Banoeng-Yakubo, Bruce	Dept. of Geology, Enreca Project for Hydro-zoology at the Dept of Zoology
Yankson, Paul W.K.	Dept of Geography, Enreca Project for Remote Sensing
Andoh, Augustin	Assistant Registrar, Office of the Vice Chancellor
Amamoo-Okyere, E.	Head of the Centre for Remote Sensing Unit (CERSGIS)
Danso, Seth K A	Ecological Laboratory
Manuh, Takyiwaa	Director of the Institute of African Studies, ULG

8.4 Bibliography (major documents)

Alemna, A. (2004): The Ghana Interlibrary Lending and Document Delivery Network (GILLDNET).

Darkwa, Akosua, Nicholas Amponsah, Nicholas and Evans, Gyampoh (2006): Civil society in a changing Ghana. An assessment of the current state of civil society in Ghana. 06/2006.

Danida (2000): Evaluation of Danida's Bilateral Programme for Enhancement of Research Capacity in Developing Countries (ENRECA). January 2000.

ECDPM (2007): Aid Effectiveness and the Provision of TA Personnel: Improving Practice. Policy Management Brief No. 20 - November 2007.

Freeman, Ted (2005): Effective States and Engaged Societies: Capacity Development for Growth, Service Delivery, Empowerment and Security in Africa: The Case of Ghana. Desk Study - Final Report, July 11, 2005. GGI Ottawa.

MFA (2002a), Act on International Development Co-operation, as published in Act no. 541 of 10 July 1998 with the latest amendments through § 2 in Act No. 410 of 6 June 2002 and Act No. 411 of 6 June 2002. Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2002b), Capacity Development Evaluation, Step 1: Contributions to an Analytical Framework, Working paper, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2003a), Capacity Development Evaluation, Step 2: Desk Study of Danish Sector Programme Support and Mifresta Interventions, Working paper, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2003b), Capacity Development Evaluation, Step 3: Draft Methodology for Evaluation of Capacity Development; Working paper, Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2004), Capacity Development Evaluation, Step 4: Between Naivety and Cynicism, Working paper, Evaluation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2005a), Evaluation Department, Brief Introduction, A Result-Oriented Approach to Capacity Change, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2005b), Evaluation Department Capacity Development Outcome Evaluation, Field-testing of the Methodology. Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

MFA (2006): Guidance note on Danish support for Capacity development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Copenhagen.

Nielsen, H. (2005): Capacity Development Support to Decentralisation and the Water Sector in Ghana. Danida.

ODI-CDD-Ghana (2007): Joint Evaluation of Multi-Donor Budget. Support to Ghana. Based on OECD-DAC methodology. June 2007. 2 Volumes.

OECD/DAC (2006): The challenge to capacity development: Working towards good practice. Paris: OECD.

OECD/DAC (2007): Peer Review. Review of the Development Co-operation Policies and Programmes of Denmark. DAC's Main Findings and Recommendations (Note by the Secretariat), 19 June 2007.

Stevens, M. and Teggemann, S. (2004). Comparative Experience with Public Service Reform in Ghana, Tanzania and Zambia in Building State Capacity in Africa: New Ap-

proaches and Emerging Lessons. Levy and Kpundeh (editors). Washington DC: World Bank Institute.

Walters, Paul (Economic Adviser, DFID Ghana) (2005): Multi-Donor Budget Support and Capacity Development: emerging lessons from Ghana. THE LENPA FORUM CASE STUDY, April 2005.

World Bank (2005): An Independent Review of World Bank Support to Capacity Building in Africa: The Case of Ghana.

World Bank / IEG (2008): Using Training to Build Capacity for Development. An Evaluation of the World Bank's Project-Based and WBI Training.

8.5 Higher Education projects under ENRECA

Project Title [ENRECA project number]	Ghanaian Institution(s)	Danish Partner Institution(s)
Laboratory for Ecological Studies with Special Emphasis on Nutrient and Water Cycling in Ghanaian Ecosystems (EcoLab) [305]	Department of Geography and Resource Development, University of Ghana	Institute of Geography, University of Copenhagen
International Business and Research Education, School of Administration at the University of Ghana, Legon [1602]	Danida Centre for International Business Research, School of Administration, University of Ghana	Centre for International Studies, Aalborg University
Enhancement of Research and Teaching Capacity in Hydrology and Hydrogeology [309]	Department of Geology, University of Ghana	Geological Institute, University of Copenhagen Institute of Geography, University of Copenhagen
Application of Remote Sensing and Digital Imaging Processing for Environmental Monitoring, Education and Research [302]	Department of Geography and Resource Development, University of Ghana	Institute of Geography, University of Copenhagen
Capacity Building for Research in Traditional Fermented Food Processing in West Africa [1101]	Department of Biological Sciences, University for Development Studies, Tamale	Department of Dairy and Food Science, Royal Danish Veterinary and Agricultural University, Copenhagen
The Accra-Copenhagen Research Link: Malaria Research Programme [306]	Noguchi Memorial Institute for Medical Research, Accra; Dept of Child Health UoG Medical School; Accra Centre for Scientific Research into Plant Medicine	Centre for Medical Parasitology, Copenhagen University Hospital; Institute of Medical Microbiology & Immunology; Royal Danish School of Pharmacy, Copenhagen
Technology Assessment in Ghana: Building Research Capabilities at the University of Ghana [901]	University of Ghana Departments of Physics with Departments of Political Science, Geography, Sociology, Library Science; Council of Scientific and Industrial Research Centre for Information Technology	Centre for Tele-Information, Technical University of Denmark
Community Initiatives in the Democratisation of Planning Practice in Ghana [1002]	Department of Planning, University of Science and Technology, Kumasi	Department of Human Settlements, Royal Danish Academy of Fine Arts, Copenhagen

Source: Danida (2000): *Evaluation of Danida's Bilateral Programme for Enhancement of Research Capacity in Developing Countries (ENRECA)*. January 2000.